

S U P R E M E C O U R T O F I N D I A
RECORD OF PROCEEDINGS

CIVIL APPEAL NO(s). 8170 OF 2009

INDIAN MEDICAL ASSOCIATION

Appellant (s)

VERSUS

UNION OF INDIA & ORS.

Respondent(s)

(With appln(s) for permission to place addl. documents on record, impleadment and prayer for interim relief and office report)

WITH Civil Appeal NO. 5757 of 2008

(With appln.(s) for impleadment and with prayer for interim relief and office report)

Civil Appeal NO. 8171 of 2009

(With prayer for interim relief and office report)

W.P(C) NO. 192 of 2010

(With appln. for interim stay)

W.P(C) NO. 320 of 2009

(With office report)

W.P(C) NO. 528 of 2009

(With appln. for directions and with office report)

Date: 25/11/2010 These Appeals/Writ Petitions were called on for hearing today.

CORAM :

HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE B. SUDERSHAN REDDY

HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE SURINDER SINGH NIJJAR

For Appellant(s)

Dr. Aman Hingorani, Adv.
Ms. Priya Hingorani, Adv.
Ms. Reema Bhandari, Adv.
Ms. Swati Sumbly, Adv.
For M/S. Hingorani & Associates, Adv.

CA 5757/2008

Mr. K.K. Venugopal, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Jaideep Gupta, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Dipak Kumar Jena, Adv.
Ms. Minakshi Ghosh Jena, Adv.
Mr. Shyam Mohan, Adv.
Mr. Man Mohan, Adv.
Mr. Dharam Das, Adv.

...2/-

-2-

For Respondent(s)

CA 8170/09

Mr. K.K. Venugopal, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Dipak Kumar Jena, Adv.
Ms. Minakshi Ghosh Jena, Adv.
Mr. Shyam Mohan, Adv.
Mr. Man Mohan, Adv.
Mr. Dharam Das, Adv.

CA 8171/09 & all
W.Ps.

Mr. Jaideep Gupta, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Dipak Kumar Jena, Adv.
Ms. Minakshi Ghosh, Adv.
Mr. Manmohan, Adv.

	Mr. Dharam Das, Adv.
For UOI	Mr. Gaurab Banerjee, ASG
Min. of Health	Mr. T.S. Doabia, Sr.Adv.
Min. of Defence	Ms. Sadhna Sandhu, adv.
	Mr. Shailender Saini, Adv.
	Mr. D.S. Mahra, Adv.
	Mr. Gautam Jha, Adv.
	Ms. Anil Katiyar, Adv.
For M.C.I.	Mr. A. Sharan, Sr.Adv.
	Mr. Amit Kumar ,Adv.
	Mr. Somesh chandra Jha, Adv.
	Mr. A.K. Singh, Adv.
For NCT of Delhi	Mr. J.S. Attri, Sr.Adv.
	Ms. Sadhana Sandhu, Adv.
	Ms. Anil Katiyar, Adv.
	Mr. Devashish Bharuka, adv.
State of Punjab	Mr. Ajay Pal, Adv.
	Mr. Prashant Shukla, Adv.
Guru Gobind Singh University	Mrs. Anita Sahani, Adv.
	Ms. Purnima Bhat Kak, Adv.

UPON hearing counsel the Court made the following
O R D E R

Heard learned counsel for the parties at length.
Hearing concluded.
Judgment reserved.

(Deepak Mansukhani)	(Sukhbir Paul Kaur)	(Renuka Sadana)
Court Master	Court Master	Court Master

BOOKS REFERRED BY MR. AMAN HINGORANI :

1. 2003 (6) SCC 697
2. 1984 (3) SCC 654
3. 1999 (8) SCC 139 (AT 190 OF THE COMPILATION)
4. AIR 1986 SC 1362 (AT 355 OF THE COMPILATION)
5. AIR 1971 SC 1762 (PARA 43 AT PAGE 230 OF THE COMPILATION)
6. 1997 (2) SCC 65 (AT 199)
7. AIR 2001 SC 3262 (AT 120)
8. AIR 1995 SC 63 (AT 145)
9. 1999 (3) SCC 176 (AT 233, PARA 20 AT 259)
10. 1981 (1) SCC 722 (BOOK USED)
11. 1995 (5) SCC 173 (324, 336)
12. AIR 1992 SC 1475 (AT 212)
13. AIR 1989 SC 177 (AT 359)
14. 2002 (1) SLR 313
15. 1995 (3) SCC 287 (PARA 5 AT 289) BOOK USED
16. 2002 (9) SCC 419 (AT 147)
17. 1995 (5) SCC 173 (324, 337)
18. 1996 (3) SCC 253 (AT 339, 348)
19. 1998 (6) SCC 284 (AT 275)
20. 1983 (3) SCC 601 (AT 280)
21. AIR 1996 SC 2552
22. 1986 (2) SCC 667

BOOKS REFERRED BY MR. GAURAB BANERJEE, ASG

2005 (6) SCC 537 (P.A. INAMDAR'S CASE)
(AT PAGES 554, 565, 568, 575, 598, 599, PARAGRAPHS 124 TO 132)

BOOKS REFERRED BY MR. AMARENDRA SHARAN, SR.ADV.

1999 (7) SCC 120 (AT 141, PARA 36 AT 154)
2002 (7) SCC 258 (PARA 23 AT 272)

BOOKS REFERRED BY MR. JAIDEEP GUPTA, SR.ADV.

2003 (7) SCC 83 (PARA 19 AT PAGE 98)
2008 (6) SCC 1 (PARA 125)
2002 (8) SCC 481