

S U P R E M E C O U R T O F I N D I A
RECORD OF PROCEEDINGS

Civil Appeal No. 10759/2013

STATE OF MAHARASHTRA & ORS.

Appellant(s)

VERSUS

ASHA RAMDAS BIDKAR & ORS.

Respondent(s)

[GROUP MATTER]

(IA No. 29365/2021 - APPLICATION FOR PERMISSION and IA No. 53584/2021 - APPLICATION FOR TAGGING/DETAGGING and IA No. 9/2014 - EXEMPTION FROM FILING O.T. and IA No. 6/2014 - EXEMPTION FROM FILING O.T. and IA No. 26310/2023 - EXEMPTION FROM FILING O.T. and IA No. 11/2014 - EXEMPTION FROM FILING O.T. and IA No. 8/2014 - INTERVENTION APPLICATION and IA No. 5/2014 - INTERVENTION APPLICATION and IA No. 70967/2020 - INTERVENTION/IMPLEADMENT and IA No. 70959/2020 - INTERVENTION/IMPLEADMENT and IA No. 70944/2020 - INTERVENTION/IMPLEADMENT and IA No. 81255/2020 - INTERVENTION/IMPLEADMENT and IA No. 81119/2020 - INTERVENTION/IMPLEADMENT and IA No. 81080/2020 - INTERVENTION/IMPLEADMENT and IA No. 74369/2020 - INTERVENTION/IMPLEADMENT and IA No. 72350/2020 - INTERVENTION/IMPLEADMENT and IA No. 72346/2020 - INTERVENTION/IMPLEADMENT and IA No. 144321/2021 - INTERVENTION/IMPLEADMENT and IA No. 26307/2023 - PERMISSION TO FILE ADDITIONAL DOCUMENTS/FACTS/ANNEXURES and IA No. 14/2015 - STAY APPLICATION and IA No. 13/2014 - STAY APPLICATION)

WITH

SLP(C) No. 13610-13611/2014 (IX)

SLP(C) No. 13616-13617/2014 (IX)

SLP(C) No. 13618-13626/2014 (IX)

SLP(C) No. 13598-13599/2014 (IX)

SLP(C) No. 7059-7060/2016 (IX)

(IA No. 11103/2018 - CLARIFICATION/DIRECTION)

SLP(C) No. 9850/2016 (IX)

SLP(C) No. 9727/2016 (IX)

SLP(C) No. 9878/2016 (IX)

SLP(C) No. 9853/2016 (IX)

SLP(C) No. 9854/2016 (IX)

SLP(C) No. 9731/2016 (IX)

SLP(C) No. 9862/2016 (IX)

SLP(C) No. 9851/2016 (IX)

SLP(C) No. 9645/2016 (IX)

SLP(C) No. 9716/2016 (IX)

**SLP(C) No. 10086/2016 (IX
)**

SLP(C) No. 11100/2021 (IX)

**Diary No(s). 25734/2021 (IX)
(FOR ADMISSION and I.R. and IA No.81467/2022-CONDONATION OF DELAY
IN FILING)**

**S.L.P.(C)...CC No. 3391/2015 (IX)
(IA No. 1/2015 - PERMISSION TO FILE PETITION (SLP/TP/WP/..))**

**SLP(C) No. 7685/2016 (IX)
(IA No. 81597/2020 - INTERVENTION/IMPLEADMENT)**

SLP(C) No. 12641/2016 (IX)

**SLP(C) No. 9697/2016 (IX)
(IA No. 44480/2018 - STAY APPLICATION)**

SLP(C) No. 9062/2016 (IX)

SLP(C) No. 8749/2016 (IX)

SLP(C) No. 10083/2016 (IX)

SLP(C) No. 9327-9346/2016 (IX)

SLP(C) No. 10811/2016 (IX)

**SLP(C) No. 10672/2016 (IX)
(IA No. 57393/2018 - CLARIFICATION/DIRECTION)**

**SLP(C) No. 10220-10221/2016 (IX)
(IA No. 57916/2018 - CLARIFICATION/DIRECTION)**

SLP(C) No. 10199/2016 (IX)

SLP(C) No. 10264/2016 (IX)
(IA No. 57494/2018 - CLARIFICATION/DIRECTION)

SLP(C) No. 10710/2016 (IX)

SLP(C) No. 12644/2016 (IX)
(IA No. 57804/2018 - CLARIFICATION/DIRECTION)

SLP(C) No. 10661-10662/2016 (IX)
(IA No. 57674/2018 - CLARIFICATION/DIRECTION)

SLP(C) No. 10241/2016 (IX)

SLP(C) No. 12068/2016 (IX)
(IA No. 57430/2018 - CLARIFICATION/DIRECTION and IA No. 55127/2021 - INTERVENTION/IMPLEADMENT)

SLP(C) No. 10377/2016 (IX)
(IA No. 57879/2018 - CLARIFICATION/DIRECTION)

SLP(C) No. 10131/2016 (IX)

SLP(C) No. 11152/2016 (IX)
(IA No. 59471/2022 - APPLICATION FOR SUBSTITUTION and IA No. 118575/2021 - APPLICATION FOR SUBSTITUTION and IA No. 57379/2018 - CLARIFICATION/DIRECTION and IA No. 59474/2022 - CONDONATION OF DELAY IN FILING SUBSTITUTION APPLN.)

SLP(C) No. 10789/2016 (IX)
(IA No. 57375/2018 - CLARIFICATION/DIRECTION)

SLP(C) No. 11575/2016 (IX)
(IA No. 57372/2018 - CLARIFICATION/DIRECTION)

SLP(C) No. 12526/2016 (IX)
(IA No. 57471/2018 - CLARIFICATION/DIRECTION)

SLP(C) No. 10194/2016 (IX)

SLP(C) No. 10759/2016 (IX)
(IA No. 57492/2018 - CLARIFICATION/DIRECTION)

SLP(C) No. 10850/2016 (IX)

SLP(C) No. 10563-10564/2016 (IX)
(IA No. 57795/2018 - CLARIFICATION/DIRECTION)'

SLP(C) No. 12652/2016 (IX)
(IA No. 57710/2018 - CLARIFICATION/DIRECTION)

SLP(C) No. 10081/2016 (IX)

**SLP(C) No. 23926/2016 (IX)
(IA No. 57489/2018 - CLARIFICATION/DIRECTION)**

**SLP(C) No. 11906-11941/2016 (IX)
(IA No. 43071/2018 - APPROPRIATE ORDERS/DIRECTIONS)**

**SLP(C) No. 11597/2016 (IX)
(IA No. 57813/2018 - CLARIFICATION/DIRECTION)**

SLP(C) No. 10101/2016 (IX)

**SLP(C) No. 11604-11607/2016 (IX)
(IA No. 88713/2018 - CLARIFICATION/DIRECTION)**

SLP(C) No. 10839/2016 (IX)

**C.A. No. 3123/2024 (III)
(IA No. 57498/2018 - CLARIFICATION/DIRECTION)**

SLP(C) No. 15158-15163/2016 (IX)

**SLP(C) No. 10870/2016 (IX)
(IA No. 117143/2021 - APPLICATION FOR SUBSTITUTION and IA No. 76019/2021 - APPLICATION FOR SUBSTITUTION and IA No. 117144/2021 -
CONDONATION OF DELAY IN FILING SUBSTITUTION APPLN.)**

**SLP(C) No. 10456/2016 (IX)
(IA No. 57423/2018 - CLARIFICATION/DIRECTION)**

SLP(C) No. 16443/2016 (IX)

SLP(C) No. 10727/2016 (IX)

SLP(C) No. 10881/2016 (IX)

SLP(C) No. 10355/2016 (IX)

SLP(C) No. 10837/2016 (IX)

**SLP(C) No. 10406/2016 (IX)
(IA No. 57918/2018 - CLARIFICATION/DIRECTION)**

**SLP(C) No. 10247-10248/2016 (IX)
(IA No. 57685/2018 - CLARIFICATION/DIRECTION)**

**SLP(C) No. 10104/2016 (IX)
(IA No. 57841/2018 - CLARIFICATION/DIRECTION)**

CA No. 10759/2013 etc.

SLP(C) No. 10140/2016 (IX)
(IA No. 57945/2018 - CLARIFICATION/DIRECTION)

SLP(C) No. 10091/2016 (IX)
(IA No. 57442/2018 - CLARIFICATION/DIRECTION)

SLP(C) No. 12117/2016 (IX)
(IA No. 57653/2018 - CLARIFICATION/DIRECTION)

SLP(C) No. 11035/2016 (IX)

SLP(C) No. 10255/2016 (IX)
(IA No. 57912/2018 - CLARIFICATION/DIRECTION)

SLP(C) No. 11045/2016 (IX)
(IA No. 57862/2018 - CLARIFICATION/DIRECTION)

SLP(C) No. 11093-11094/2016 (IX)
(IA No. 57643/2018 - CLARIFICATION/DIRECTION)

SLP(C) No. 12147-12148/2016 (IX)
(IA No. 57694/2018 - CLARIFICATION/DIRECTION)

SLP(C) No. 11629-11639/2016 (IX)
(IA No. 43100/2018 - CLARIFICATION/DIRECTION)

SLP(C) No. 11588/2016 (IX)
(IA No. 57865/2018 - CLARIFICATION/DIRECTION)

SLP(C) No. 10095/2016 (IX)
(IA No. 57715/2018 - CLARIFICATION/DIRECTION)

SLP(C) No. 10529/2016 (IX)

SLP(C) No. 11041-11042/2016 (IX)
(IA No. 57781/2018 - CLARIFICATION/DIRECTION)

SLP(C) No. 12069/2016 (IX)
(IA No. 57399/2018 - CLARIFICATION/DIRECTION)

SLP(C) No. 10470/2016 (IX)

SLP(C) No. 10813/2016 (IX)
(IA No. 57774/2018 - CLARIFICATION/DIRECTION)

SLP(C) No. 11111/2016 (IX)

SLP(C) No. 10703/2016 (IX)

SLP(C) No. 10891/2016 (IX)

CA No. 10759/2013 etc.

SLP(C) No. 23029/2016 (IX)
(IA No. 57462/2018 - CLARIFICATION/DIRECTION)

SLP(C) No. 11097/2016 (IX)

SLP(C) No. 10142/2016 (IX)

SLP(C) No. 11044/2016 (IX)

SLP(C) No. 10674/2016 (IX)

SLP(C) No. 11107/2016 (IX)

SLP(C) No. 10471/2016 (IX)

SLP(C) No. 10547/2016 (IX)

SLP(C) No. 10464/2016 (IX)

SLP(C) No. 10483/2016 (IX)

SLP(C) No. 10157/2016 (IX)

SLP(C) No. 11091/2016 (IX)

SLP(C) No. 10532/2016 (IX)

SLP(C) No. 10678/2016 (IX)

SLP(C) No. 10138/2016 (IX)
(IA No. 1/2016 - CONDONATION OF DELAY IN FILING)

SLP(C) No. 26540/2016 (IX)
(IA No. 57765/2018 - CLARIFICATION/DIRECTION)

SLP(C) No. 10085/2016 (IX)

SLP(C) No. 10457/2016 (IX)

SLP(C) No. 12028/2016 (IX)
(IA No. 57902/2018 - CLARIFICATION/DIRECTION)

SLP(C) No. 15107/2016 (IX)

SLP(C) No. 15109/2016 (IX)

SLP(C) No. 15236/2016 (IX)
(IA No. 57767/2018 - CLARIFICATION/DIRECTION)

SLP(C) No. 15186-15191/2016 (IX)
(IA No. 43093/2018 - APPROPRIATE ORDERS/DIRECTIONS)

SLP(C) No. 15192/2016 (IX)

SLP(C) No. 15070-15073/2016 (IX)

SLP(C) No. 15194-15196/2016 (IX)

SLP(C) No. 15235/2016 (IX)

SLP(C) No. 15197/2016 (IX)

SLP(C) No. 15075-15077/2016 (IX)

SLP(C) No. 15193/2016 (IX)

SLP(C) No. 15198-15234/2016 (IX)
(IA No. 90573/2018 - CLARIFICATION/DIRECTION and IA No. 87225/2018 - CLARIFICATION/DIRECTION)

SLP(C) No. 15065-15069/2016 (IX)

SLP(C) No. 13686/2016 (IX)
(IA No. 2/2016 - PERMISSION TO FILE SYNOPSIS AND LIST OF DATES)

SLP(C) No. 16494-16500/2016 (IX)
(IA No. 114207/2019 - APPROPRIATE ORDERS/DIRECTIONS)

W.P.(C) No. 303/2016 (X)
(IA No. 72821/2020 - APPLICATION FOR PERMISSION and IA No. 149224/2021 - APPLICATION FOR PERMISSION and IA No. 126610/2021 - EXEMPTION FROM FILING AFFIDAVIT and IA No. 87294/2021 - EXEMPTION FROM FILING AFFIDAVIT and IA No. 87291/2021 - EXEMPTION FROM FILING AFFIDAVIT and IA No. 86847/2021 - EXEMPTION FROM FILING AFFIDAVIT and IA No. 126605/2021 - INTERVENTION APPLICATION and IA No. 86845/2021 - INTERVENTION/IMPLEADMENT and IA No. 149214/2021 - INTERVENTION/IMPLEADMENT and IA No. 83093/2020 - INTERVENTION/IMPLEADMENT and IA No. 72805/2020 - INTERVENTION/IMPLEADMENT and IA No. 87293/2021 - INTERVENTION/IMPLEADMENT and IA No. 87290/2021 - INTERVENTION/IMPLEADMENT and IA No. 18125/2022 - INTERVENTION/IMPLEADMENT)

SLP(C) No. 6036/2018 (IX)

SLP(C) No. 14537/2016 (IX)

SLP(C) No. 16491/2016 (IX)

S.L.P.(C)...CC No. 19532/2016 (IX)
(IA No. 1/2016 - CONDONATION OF DELAY IN FILING and IA No. 2/2016 - CONDONATION OF DELAY IN REFILING / CURING THE DEFECTS)

SLP(C) No. 23113-23122/2016 (IX)

SLP(C) No. 17511-17512/2016 (IX)
(IA No. 43109/2018 - APPROPRIATE ORDERS/DIRECTIONS)

S.L.P.(C)...CC No. 12932/2016 (IX)
(IA No. 43126/2018 - APPROPRIATE ORDERS/DIRECTIONS and IA No. 1/2016 - CONDONATION OF DELAY IN FILING)

SLP(C) No. 25077/2016 (IX)
(IA No. 57659/2018 - CLARIFICATION/DIRECTION)

SLP(C) No. 27562/2016 (IX)
(IA 3/2016 - FOR EXEMPTION FROM FILING O.T.)

C.A. No. 10015/2016 (III)

SLP(C) No. 30103-30105/2016 (IX)

SLP(C) No. 34006/2016 (IX)

SLP(C) No. 30101/2016 (IX)
(IA 3/2016 - FOR EXEMPTION FROM FILING O.T.)

SLP(C) No. 34742/2016 (IX)

SLP(C) No. 1122/2017 (IX)
(IA No. 57832/2018 - CLARIFICATION/DIRECTION)

SLP(C) No. 3955/2017 (IX)

Date : 30-01-2025 These matters were called on for hearing today.

CORAM :

HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE J.K. MAHESHWARI
HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE ARAVIND KUMAR

For parties :

Ms. Aparna Bhat, Sr. Adv.
Ms. Rajkumari Banju, AOR
Ms. Karishma Maria, Adv.

Mr. Pukhrambam Ramesh Kumar, AOR
Mr. Karun Sharma, Adv.
Ms. Anupama Ngangom, Adv.
Ms. Rajkumari Divyasana, Adv.

Mr. Rahul Chitnis, Adv.
Ms. Shwetal Shepal, Adv.
Mr. Aditya Khanna, Adv.

Mr. Chander Shekhar Ashri, AOR

**Mr. Subash S. Kadam, Adv.
Mr. Hitesh Kumar Sharma, Adv.
Mr. Sandeep Singh Dingra, Adv.
Mr. Amit Kumar Chawla, Adv.
Mr. Varun Varma, Adv.
Mr. Akhileshwar Jha, Adv.
Mr. Abhi J. S. Kamle, Adv.
Mr. Gopal Balwant Sathe, AOR**

**Mr. Balbir Singh, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Siddharth Dharmadhikari, Adv.
Mr. Aaditya Aniruddha Pande, AOR
Mr. Shrirang B. Varma, Adv.
Mr. Bharat Bagla, Adv.
Mr. Naman Tandon, Adv.
Mr. Aditya Krishna, Adv.
Ms. Preet S. Phanse, Adv.
Mr. Adarsh Dubey, Adv.**

Mr. Jay Kishor Singh, AOR

**Mr. Guru Krishnakumar, Sr. Adv.
Ms. Aparna Bhat, Sr. Adv.
Ms. Karishma Maria, Adv.
Mr. Vishesh Goel, Adv.
Mr. Ashwin K, Adv.
Mr. Kv Sriwas Narayanan, Adv.
Mr. Yash S. Vijay, AOR**

Mr. Karunakar Mahalik, AOR

**Mr. Shivaji M. Jadhav, Adv.
Mr. Brij Kishor Sah, Adv.
Mr. Adarsh Kumar Pandey, Adv.
Mr. Vignesh Singh, Adv.
Mr. Aditya S. Jadhav, Adv.
M/S. S.M. Jadhav And Company, AOR**

Mr. Ravindra Keshavrao Adsure, AOR

**Mr. Satyajit A. Desai, Adv.
Mr. Siddharth Gautam, Adv.
Mr. Abhinav K. Mutyalwar, Adv.
Mr. Siddharth Gautam, Adv.
Ms. Anagha S. Desai, AOR
Mr. Sachin Singh, Adv.
Mr. Preetraj R. Dhok, Adv.
Mr. Ananya Thapliyal, Adv.**

Mr. Shriram P. Pingle, AOR

Mr. V. Giri, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Amol Nirmalkumar Suryawanshi, AOR
Ms. S. Soorya Gayathry, Adv.
Ms. Srishty Pandey, Adv.
Mr. Ashutosh Chaturvedi, Adv.

Mr. Venkateswara Rao Anumolu, AOR

Dr. R. R. Deshpande, AOR
Mr. Bhagwant Deshpande, Adv.

Mr. Abdulrahiman Tamboli, Adv.
Mr. Prakash Chandra Sharma, Adv.
Mr. S. Gowthaman, AOR

Mr. Vaibhav Yeshwant Kulkarni, AOR

Mr. Kundan Kumar Lal, AOR

Ms. Anuradha Mutatkar, AOR

Dr. Manish Singhvi, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Anjani Kumar Mishra, AOR
Mr. Shiv Ram Pandey, Adv.
Mrs. Sandhya Pandey, Adv.
Mr. Kishor Shankar Dere, Adv.
Mr. Praveen Mishra, Adv.
Mr. Ajay K Tiwari, Adv.

Ms. Rukhsana Choudhury, AOR

Mr. Suhas Kadam, Adv.
M/S. Black & White Solicitors, AOR

Mr. Suhaskumar Kadam, Adv.

Mr. Sandeep Sudhakar Deshmukh, AOR

Ms. Abha R. Sharma, AOR

Mr. Navin Prakash, AOR

Mr. A. N. Arora, AOR

Ms. Aparna Jha, AOR

Mr. Prashant R Dahat, Adv.
Mr. Shreyas Gacche, Adv.

Mr. Puneet Yadav, Adv.
Mr. Sourabh Gupta, Adv.
Mr. Vasu Dev, Adv.
Mr. T. R. B. Sivakumar, AOR

Ms. K. V. Bharathi Upadhyaya, AOR

Mr. J. N. Singh, Adv.
Mr. Meghraj Singh, Adv.
Mr. Satvik Tripathi, Adv.
Mr. Venkateswara Rao Anumolu, AOR

Mr. Sudhanshu S. Choudhari, AOR

Mr. Amol Chitale, Adv.
Mrs. Pragya Baghel, AOR

Mr. Balbir Singh, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Siddharth Dharmadhikari, Adv.
Mr. Aaditya Aniruddha Pande, AOR
Mr. Shrirang B. Varma, Adv.
Mr. Naman Tandon, Adv.
Mr. Bharat Bagla, Adv.
Mr. Aditya Krishna, Adv.
Ms. Preet S. Phanse, Adv.
Mr. Adarsh Dubey, Adv.

Mr. Nishant Ramakantrao Katneshwarkar, AOR

Mr. Amol B. Karande, AOR
Mr. Omveer, Adv.
Ms. Chandana, Adv.
Mr. Rajiv Agnihotri, Adv.

Mr. Sachin Patil, AOR

Mr. Sunil Fernandes, AOR

Mr. Arjun Harkauli, AOR

Mr. Amol Nirmalkumar Suryawanshi, AOR

Mr. Shivaji M. Jadhav, AOR
Mr. Shivaji M. Jadhav, Adv.
Mr. Brij Kishor Sah, Adv.
Mr. Adarsh Kumar Pandey, Adv.
Mr. Vignesh Singh, Adv.
Mr. Aditya S. Jadhav, Adv.

Dr. R. R. Deshpande, AOR
Mr. Bhagwant Deshpande, Adv.

Mr. Kishor Lambat, Adv.
Ms. Suja Joshi, Adv.
Ms. Kashmira Lambat, Adv.
Mr. Prem S Mankani, Adv.
M/S. Lambat And Associates, AOR

Mr. Gopal Balwant Sathe, AOR

Ms. Rucha Pande, Adv.
Mr. A. Selvin Raja, AOR

Mr. Somanatha Padhan, AOR

Mr. Manoj Ranjan Sinha, Adv.
Mr. Vishal Agrawal, Adv.
Mr. Piyush Prashant, Adv.
Mr. Rameshwar Prasad Goyal, AOR

Mr. Shashibhushan P. Adgaonkar, AOR

Mr. T. Mahipal, AOR
Mr. Manoj Ranjan Sinha (r-23), Adv.
Mr. Vishal Agrawal, Adv.

Mr. Shriram P. Pingle, AOR
Ms. Sneha Ravi Iyer, AOR
Mr. Anand Dilip Landge, AOR

Mr. Anjani Kumar Mishra, AOR
Dr. Manish Singhvi, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Shiv Ram Pandey, Adv.
Mrs. Sandhya Pandey, Adv.
Mr. Praveen Mishra, Adv.
Dr. Kishor Dere, Adv.

Mr. Chander Shekhar Ashri, AOR
Mr. Sudhanshu S. Choudhari, AOR

**UPON hearing the counsel the Court made the following
O R D E R**

- 1) After order dated 25.03.2015 was passed by this Court, the High Court has decided batch of cases *vide* judgment dated 23.12.2015 which is challenged by filing several appeals. The appellants in those appeals shall start the

arguments first. Other appeals filed by the State of Maharashtra against the judgment pronounced previously would be heard subsequently.

2) Convenience compilation has already been filed. However, learned counsel appearing on behalf of some of the appellants states that some of the documents have not been attached in the volumes of convenience compilation. They are at liberty to file the same within a period of two weeks from today in continuation to the existing volumes of the convenience compilation, supplying copy to all the parties.

3) As consented by the learned counsel for the parties, list the matters for hearing on 20th February, 2025.

(NIDHI AHUJA)
AR-cum-PS

(ANJALI PANWAR)
COURT MASTER (NSH)