SECTION X

## SUPREME COURT OF INDIA

**RECORD OF PROCEEDINGS** 

Writ Petition (Civil) No.940/2017

**BIKRAM CHATTERJI & ORS.** 

Petitioner(s)

### **VERSUS**

UNION OF INDIA & ORS.

Respondent(s)

(MATTER CONCERNING SALE OF FAR; NOTE OF NBCC DATED 05.08.2022; MATTER CONCERNING SUREKHA FAMILY; No.100821/2021 IΑ PERMISSION; IA No.110402/2020 - FOR TAKING ON RECORD; IA No.110027/ 2020 - FOR TAKING ON RECORD; IA No.100822/2021 - FOR APPROPRIATE No.50370/2020 IΑ FOR APPROPRIATE ORDERS/DIRECTIONS; -DIRECTIONS; IA No.109599/2020 - FOR APPROPRIATE ORDERS/ DIRECTIONS; IA No.109576/2020 - FOR CLARIFICATION/DIRECTION; IA No.189314/2019 **FOR** COMPLIANCE 0F COURTS ORDER; IΑ No.109573/2020 IA No.105017/2021 INTERVENTION/IMPLEADMENT; FOR INTERVENTION/ IMPLEADMENT; IA No.109596/2020 - FOR INTERVENTION/IMPLEADMENT; IA No.60700/2020 - FOR PERMISSION TO FILE ADDITIONAL DOCUMENTS/FACTS/ ANNEXURES; IA No.127793/2019 - FOR RECALLING THE COURT'S ORDER; and, IA No.127787/2019 - FOR RECALLING THE COURT'S ORDER)

### WITH

- W.P.(C) No.245/2018 (X)
- W.P.(C) No.306/2018 (X)
- W.P.(C) No.502/2019 (X)
- Diary No(s).36392/2019 (X)
- SLP(C) No.1879/2018 (XVII)
- SMC(Crl) No.4/2018 (XVII)
- W.P.(C) No.378/2018 (X)
- W.P.(C) No.298/2018 (X)
- CONMT.PET.(C) No.483/2020 in W.P.(C) No.940/2017 (X)
- W.P.(C) No.288/2018 (X)
- W.P.(C) No.1397/2018 (X)

- W.P.(C) No.246/2018 (X)
- W.P.(C) No.226/2018 (X)
- W.P.(C) No.267/2018 (X)
- W.P.(C) No.1018/2017 (X)
- W.P.(C) No.353/2018 (X)
- W.P.(C) No.460/2018 (X)
- W.P.(C) No.829/2018 (X)
- W.P.(C) No.742/2018 (X)
- W.P.(C) No.199/2018 (X)
- W.P.(C) No.134/2018 (X)
- W.P.(C) No.164/2018 (X)
- W.P.(C) No.1206/2017 (X)
- W.P.(C) No.281/2018 (X)
- W.P.(C) No.1116/2017 (X)
- W.P.(C) No.1156/2017 (X)
- W.P.(C) No.1144/2017 (X)
- W.P.(C) No.1041/2017 (X)
- W.P.(C) No.971/2017 (X)
- W.P.(C) No.947/2017 (X)
- W.P.(C) No.56/2018 (X)
- W.P.(C) No.57/2018 (X)
- W.P.(C) No.74/2018 (X)
- W.P.(C) No.131/2018 (X)
- W.P.(C) No.182/2018 (X)

W.P.(C) No.942/2017 (PIL-W) (IA No.78918/2021 – FOR APPROPRIATE ORDERS/DIRECTIONS; and, IA No.110167/2020 – FOR INTERVENTION)

W.P.(C) No.8/2018 (X)

W.P.(C) No.1242/2017 (X)

W.P.(C) No.58/2018 (X)

W.P.(C) No.21/2018 (X)

W.P.(C) No.52/2018 (X)

W.P.(C) No.91/2018 (X)

W.P.(C) No.160/2018 (X)

Date: 23-09-2022 These matters were called on for hearing today.

#### CORAM:

HON'BLE THE CHIEF JUSTICE HON'BLE MS. JUSTICE BELA M. TRIVEDI

### Counsel for the Parties:

Mr. R. Venkataramani, Sr. Adv./Court Receiver

Mr. Chitvan Singhal, Adv.

Mr. Rajeev Gupta, Adv.

Mr. Pavan Aggarwal, Forensic Auditor

Mr. Ravinder Bhatia, Forensic Auditor

Mr. M.L. Lahoty, Adv.

Mr. Paban K. Sharma, Adv.

Mr. Anchit Sripat, Adv.

Mr. Pranab Kumar Nayak, Adv.

Mr. Himanshu Shekhar, AOR

Mr. Kumar Mihir, AOR

Mr. Ravindra Kumar, Sr. Adv.

Mr. Binay Kumar Das, AOR

Ms. Priyanka Das, Adv.

Ms. Neha Das, Adv.

Ms. Saloni Sharan, Adv.

Mr. Siddhartha Dave, Sr. Adv.

Mr. Gudipati G. Kashyap, Adv.

Ms. Apoorva Pandey, Adv.

Ms. T. Archana, AOR

Mr. Manoj Singh, Adv.

Mr. Sanjay Kumar Visen, AOR

Ms. Ritu Rastogi, Adv.

Ms. Mohini Kumari, Adv.

Mr. Suresh Kumar Bhan, Adv.

Ms. Sandeep Joshi, Adv.

Mr. Aman, Adv.

Mr. Sanjay Jain, ASG

Ms. Aishwarya Bhati, ASG

Mr. Mukesh Kumar Maroria, AOR

Mr. Mukul Singh, Adv.

Ms. Preeti Rani, Adv.

Mohd. Akhil, Adv.

Ms. Aishwarya Bhati, ASG

Ms. V. Mohana, Sr. Adv.

Mr. Prashant Singh, Adv.

Mr. Mukul Singh, Adv.

Mr. Sughosh Subramnyam, Adv.

Mr. Vikrant Yadav, Adv.

Mr. R.R. Rajesh, Adv.

Mohd. Akhil, Adv.

Mr. Raj Bahadur Yadav, AOR

Ms. Aishwarya Bhati, ASG

Ms. V. Mohana, Sr. Adv.

Mr. Gurmeet Singh Makker, AOR

Mr. Mukul Singh, Adv.

Mohd. Akhil, Adv.

Mr. Sughosh Subramanyam, Adv.

Mr. Nachiketa Joshi, Adv.

Mr. Prashant Singh, Adv.

Ms. Aishwarya Bhati, ASG

Ms. V. Mohana, Sr. Adv.

Mr. Prashant Singh, Adv.

Mr. Mukul Singh, Adv.

Mr. Nachiketa Joshi, Adv.

Mr. Sughosh Subramanyam, Adv.

Mr. Arvind Kumar Sharma, AOR

Mr. P.N. Mishra, Sr. Adv.

Mr. Niraj Gupta, AOR

Ms. Anshu Gupta, Adv.

Mr. Fuzail Khan, Adv.

Mr. Ashutosh Srivastava, Adv.

Mr. Rakesh K. Khanna, Sr. Adv.

Mr. Niraj Gupta, AOR

Mr. Fuzail Khan, Adv.

Ms. Ramya Khanna, Adv.

Mr. Ashish J., Adv.

Ms. Anshu Gupta, Adv.

Mr. Ashutosh Srivastava, Adv.

Mr. Rakesh K. Khanna, Sr. Adv.

Mr. H.S. Parihar, AOR

Mr. Kuldeep S. Parihar, Adv.

Ms. Ikshita Parihar, Adv.

Mr. Kavin Gulati, Sr. Adv.

Mr. Alok Kr. Aggarwal, Adv.

Ms. Anushruti, Adv.

Ms. Simran Arora, Adv.

Ms. Anubha Agrawal, AOR

Mr. S.K. Gangele, Sr. Adv.

Mr. A. P. Mohanty, AOR

Mr. Prathvi Raj Chauhan, Adv.

Ms. Priya Sharma, Adv.

Ms. Garima Prashad, Sr. Adv.

Ms. Ruchira Goel, AOR

Mr. Abhitosh Pratap Singh, Adv.

Ms. Rita Bhandari, Adv.

Mr. Brijender Chahar, Sr. Adv.

Ms. Jyoti Chahar, Adv.

Mr. Karan Chahar, Adv.

Ms. Pooja Chahar, Adv.

Mr. Shashi Bhushan, Adv.

Mr. Vinay Garg, AOR

Mr. Surendra Kumar, Sr. Adv.

Mr. M. T. George, AOR

Ms. Susy Abrahm, Adv.

Mr. Johns George, Adv.

Mr. Vijay Kumar, Sr. Adv.

Mr. Rajiv Kumar, AOR

Mr. Kishlay Shukla, Adv.

Ms. Purnima Jain, Adv.

Mr. Sanjeev Gupta, Adv.

Mr. Rishi K. Awasthi, Adv.

Mr. Prashant Kumar, Adv.

Ms. Ritu Arora, Adv.

Mr. Piyush Vatsa, Adv.

Mr. Santosh Kumar-I, AOR

- Dr. Sumant Bharadwaj, Adv.
- Mr. Vedant Bharadwaj, Adv.
- Ms. Mridula Ray Bharadwaj, AOR
- Mr. Rakesh Kailash Sharma, Adv.
- Mr. Ajay Bansal, Adv.
- Mr. Gaurav Yadava, Adv.
- Ms. Beena Bansal, Adv.
- Mr. Kuldip Singh, AOR
- Mr. G. N. Reddy, AOR
- Mr. Alok Kumar, Adv.
- Mr. Manan Gambhir, Adv.
- Ms. Garima Soni, Adv.
- Ms. Nandita Jha, Adv.
- Mr. Vivek Kumar Pandey, Adv.
- Mr. Krishna Kant Dubey, Adv.
- Mr. Vivek Kumar Pandey, Adv.
- Ms. Shuchi Singh, Adv.
- Mr. Sanjay Kumar Dubey, AOR
- Mr. Jainendra Kumar, Adv.
- Mr. Aman Kumar, Adv.
- Mr. Binod Kumar Singh, Adv.
- Mr. Kirshna Vani Sharma, Adv.
- Mr. Hitesh Kumar Sharma, Adv.
- Mr. S.K. Rajora, Adv.
- Mr. Akhileshwar Jha, Adv.
- Mr. Ranjit Kumar Sharma, AOR
- Ms. Richa Kapoor, AOR
- Ms. Saloni Mahajan, Adv.
- Ms. Shivani Sharma, Adv.
- Ms. Jyoti Zongluju, Adv.
- Ms. Aishwarya Mishra, Adv.
- Mr. Sanjay Kapur, AOR
- Ms. Subhra Kapur, Adv.
- Ms. Megha Karnwal, Adv.
- Mr. Arjun Bhatia, Adv.
- Ms. Akshata Joshi, Adv.
- Mr. Pradeep Misra, AOR
- Mr. Daleep Dhyani, Adv.
- Mr. Manoj Kumar Sharma, Adv.
- Mr. Suraj Singh, Adv.

- Mr. Saket Singh, Adv.
- Ms. Sangeeta Singh, Adv.
- Ms. Niranjana Singh, AOR
- Mr. Ashok Kumar Singh, AOR
- Mr. Shantwanu Singh, Adv.
- Ms. Pragya Singh, Adv.
- Ms. Akshay Singh, Adv.
- Dr. Ritu Bhardwaj, Adv.
- Mr. Sachin Mittal, AOR
- Mr. Karan Giri, Adv.
- Mr. Rachit Mittal, Adv.
- Mr. Parish Kumar, Adv.
- Ms. Pooja Kapur, Adv.
- Mr. Sudhir Naagar, AOR
- Mr. Pai Amit, AOR
- Ms. Komal Mundhra, Adv.
- Mr. Saurabh Agrawal, Adv.
- Mr. Shantanu Singh, Adv.
- Mr. Amitesh Chandra Mishra, Adv.
- Mr. Ankit Chaturvedi, Adv.
- Mr. Niteen Kumar Sinha, Adv.
- Ms. Reetu Saipawar, Adv.
- Ms. Pratibha Yadav, Adv.
- Mr. Ram Naresh, Adv.
- For ACM Legal, AOR
- Mr. Devendra Kumar Singh, Adv.
- Mr. Karunakar Mahalik, AOR
- Mr. Arpit Rai, Adv.
- Mr. Aviral Kashyap, AOR
- Mr. Anil Gaur, Adv.
- Ms. Neha Chaudhary, Adv.
- Ms. Nalini Singh, Adv.
- Dr. Sunil K. Khattri, Adv.
- Mr. Ambrish Rai, Adv.
- Mr. Badri Prasad Singh, AOR
- Mr. Vikas Jain, AOR
- Mr. Aviral Saxena, Adv.
- Mr. Manjeet Singh Rathor, Adv.
- Mr. Digant Mishra, Adv.

- Mr. G.A. Sundram, Adv.
- Mr. Raj Kamal, AOR
- Mr. Kartavya Batra, Adv.
- Mr. Aseem Atwal, Adv.
- Ms. Stuti, Adv.
- Mr. Abhijit Sengupta, AOR
- Mr. Rohit Jaiswal, Adv.
- Ms. Kuheli Mitra, Adv.
- Mr. Shiv Singh Yadav, Adv.
- Mr. Karan Singh Chhabra, Adv.
- Ms. Sujata Kurdukar, AOR
- Ms. Tanuj Bagga Sharma, AOR
- Mr. Ashutosh Shukla, Adv.
- Dr. M.K. Ravi, Adv.
- Mr. Siddharth Acharya, Adv.
- Ms. Sonali Agarwal, Adv.
- Ms. Mithu Jain, AOR
- Mr. Rajul Shrivastav, Adv.
- Ms. Monisha Handa, Adv.
- Mr. Mohit D. Ram, AOR
- Mr. Janender Kumar Chumbak, Adv.
- Ms. Radhika, Adv.
- Ms. Amita Singh Kalkal, AOR
- Mr. Sureshan P., AOR
- Ms. Roma Singh, Adv.
- Mr. Utkarsh Singh, Adv.
- Ms. Jasmine Damkewala, AOR
- Ms. Vaishali Sharma, Adv.
- Ms. Lovely Gargi, Adv.
- Mr. Ramesh Babu M. R., AOR
- Ms. Manisha Singh, Adv.
- Ms. Jagriti Bharti, Adv.
- Mr. Brijesh Kumar Tamber, AOR
- Mr. Yashu Rustagi, Adv.
- Mr. Ashutosh, Adv.
- M/s. V. Maheshwari & Co., AOR
- Mr. Rohit Amit Sthalekar, AOR
- Mr. Avi Tandon, Adv.

- Mr. Rajeev Lochan, Adv.
- Mr. Prithvi Pal, AOR
- Mr. Anand Nandan, Adv.
- Mr. Amit Pawan, AOR
- Dr. Ritu Bhardwaj, Adv.
- Mr. Naresh Kumar, AOR
- Mr. Kaushal Kishore, Adv.
- Mr. Devendra Singh, AOR
- Mr. Parul Dhurve, Adv.
- Mr. Omanakuttan K.K., AOR
- Mohd. Moonis Abbasi, Adv.
- Mr. Shakil Ahmad Syed, AOR
- Ms. Smita Pandey, Adv.
- Mr. Narendra Kr. Verma, AOR
- Mr. Aditya Nayyar, Adv.
- Ms. Farhat Jahan Rehmani, AOR
- Suman Tripathy, Adv.
- Mr. Rameshwar Prasad Goyal, AOR
- Ms. Indrani Mukherjee, Adv.
- Ms. Tatini Basu, AOR
- Mr. Kamlendra Mishra, AOR
- M/s. Dharmaprabhas Law Associates, AOR
- Mr. Abhigya Kushwah, AOR
- Ms. Anagha S. Desai, AOR
- Mr. Divyakant Lahoti, AOR
- M/s. Kings & Alliance LLP, AOR
- Mr. Rajesh P., AOR
- Mr. Nirmal Kumar Ambastha, AOR
- Mr. Deepak Prakash, AOR
- Ms. Kamakshi S. Mehlwal, AOR
- Mr. Dharmendra Kumar Sinha, AOR

- Ms. Arti Singh, AOR
- Mr. Kaushal Yadav, AOR
- Mr. Tushar Singh, AOR
- Ms. Shobha Gupta, AOR
- M/s. Cyril Amarchand Mangaldas, AOR
- Mr. Shovan Mishra, AOR
- Mr. Rohit Kumar Singh, AOR
- Kumar Dushyant Singh, AOR
- Ms. Anisha Upadhyay, AOR
- Mr. Aditya Jain-1, AOR
- Ms. E. R. Sumathy, AOR
- Mr. Ashok Mathur, AOR
- Mr. Vivek Narayan Sharma, AOR
- Mr. Satish Pandey, AOR
- Mr. Abhinav Shrivastava, AOR
- Mr. Dheeraj Nair, AOR
- Mr. Balaji Srinivasan, AOR
- Ms. Charu Ambwani, AOR
- Dr. Sarvam Ritam Khare, AOR
- Mr. Malak Manish Bhatt, AOR
- Mr. Sanchit Garg, AOR
- Mr. Prateek K Chadha, AOR
- Mr. Udita Singh, AOR
- Mr. Amrish Kumar, AOR
- M/s. Devasa & Co., AOR

- M/s. PBA Legal, AOR
- Mr. Sanjeev Gupta, Adv.
- Mr. Divyesh Pratap Singh, AOR
- Mr. Sumit Kumar, AOR
- Ms. Taruna Singh Gohil, AOR
- Mr. Deepak Goel, AOR
- Mr. Sonal Jain, AOR
- Mr. Vivek Sharma, AOR
- Mr. Jasmeet Singh, AOR
- Mr. Shubham Bhalla, AOR
- Mr. Kanhaiya Singhal, AOR
- Mr. Arup Banerjee, AOR
- Mr. Anuj Kapoor, AOR
- Ms. Charu Mathur, AOR
- Mr. Abhinav Agrawal, AOR
- Ms. Sangeeta Singh, AOR
- Ms. Sayaree Basu Mallik, AOR
- Mr. Shishir Pinaki, AOR
- Mr. G. Balaji, AOR
- Mr. B. K. Satija, AOR
- Ms. Pallavi Pratap, AOR
- Mr. Manish Kumar Saran, AOR
- Mr. Sukant Vikram, AOR
- Mr. Gopal Jha, AOR
- Mr. Shadan Farasat, AOR

Mr. Kailash Prashad Pandey, AOR

Mr. Abdul Azeem Kalebudde, AOR

Mohammed Sadique T.A., AOR

Mr. Gaurav Goel, AOR

Mr. Akhilesh Kumar Pandey, AOR

Ms. Rakhi Ray, AOR

Ms. Tulika Mukherjee, AOR

Mr. Rabin Majumder, AOR

Mr. Rajesh Kumar Gupta, AOR

Mr. Praveen Chaturvedi, AOR

Mr. Siddhartha Jha, AOR

Ms. Prerna Mehta, AOR

Mr. Umesh Kumar Khaitan, AOR

Ms. Sneha Kalita, AOR

Mr. Jay Kishor Singh, AOR

Ms. Mayuri Raghuvanshi, AOR

Mr. Somesh Chandra Jha, AOR

Mr. Awanish Sinha, AOR

Mr. Somiran Sharma, AOR

Ms. Astha Sharma, AOR

Mr. Pramod Dayal, AOR

Mr. Alok Tripathi, AOR

Ms. Vandana Sehgal, AOR

Ms. Anannya Ghosh, AOR

- Mr. Sanjai Kumar Pathak, AOR
- Mr. Aakarshan Aditya, AOR
- Mr. Pawanshree Agrawal, AOR
- Mr. Syed Mehdi Imam, AOR
- Mr. K. Paari Vendhan, AOR
- Mr. Ashwarya Sinha, AOR
- Ms. Kirti Renu Mishra, AOR
- M/s. Karanjawala & Co., AOR
- Mr. Kumar Sudeep, Adv.
- Ms. Dharitry Phookan, AOR
- Mr. Chandan Kumar, AOR
- Mr. Gaurav, AOR
- Ms. Manisha Ambwani, AOR
- Ms. Chandan Ramamurthi, AOR
- Ms. Mona K. Rajvanshi, AOR
- Mr. Mishra Saurabh, AOR
- Mr. Christopher D'souza, AOR
- Ms. Divya Roy, AOR
- Mr. Kabir Dixit, AOR
- Mr. S. K. Verma, AOR
- Mr. Somanatha Padhan, AOR
- Ms. Anindita Pujari, AOR
- Mr. Rajat Mittal, AOR
- Mr. Rahul Joshi, AOR

- Mr. Vipin Kumar Jai, AOR
- Mr. Ravindra Sadanand Chingale, AOR
- Mr. Sumit Sinha, AOR
- Mr. T. Mahipal, AOR
- Ms. Shilpa Liza George, AOR
- M/s. D.S.K. Legal, AOR
- Mr. Vishnu Sharma, AOR
- Mr. Ritesh Agrawal, AOR
- Ms. Indra Sawhney, AOR
- Mr. Aneesh Mittal, AOR
- Mr. Vishal Gupta, AOR
- Mr. Aman Gupta, AOR
- Mr. Chandra Prakash, AOR
- Mr. Bhuwan Raj, AOR
- Mr. E. C. Vidya Sagar, AOR
- Mr. Uddyam Mukherjee, AOR
- Mr. Anil Kumar Mishra-I, AOR
- Mr. Kaushik Choudhury, AOR
- Mr. Anas Tanwir, AOR
- Mr. Ejaz Maqbool, AOR
- Ms. Swarupama Chaturvedi, AOR
- Mr. Rishi Matoliya, AOR
- Mr. Tahir Ashraf Siddiqui, AOR
- Ms. Bharti Tyagi, AOR
- Mr. Anoop Prakash Awasthi, AOR

Mr. Kedar Nath Tripathy, AOR

Ms. Rashmi Singh, AOR

Mr. Sunil Fernandes, AOR

Ms. Rajkumari Banju, AOR

Mr. Ajit Sharma, AOR

Ms. Aruna Gupta, AOR

UPON hearing the counsel the Court made the following
O R D E R

## PART - I

# NOTE DATED 01.09.2022 SUBMITTED BY MR. R. VENKATARAMANI, COURT RECEIVER

### Re.: SALE OF FAR

Learned Court Receiver has invited our attention to the Order dated 10.06.2020 passed by this Court and paragraphs 9, 10, 12, 13 and 16 of the Order in particular.

It is submitted that the unsold units and unused FAR that can be utilised to sub-serve the interest of the home-buyers broadly fall in two categories:

The unused portion of FAR in projects that are completed or nearing completion where the unused portion of FAR is part of the constructed project itself. II. In a project comprising of more than one building, where no construction has been effected at all in certain portion(s) of the land and such portion(s) of land can be used for further development on its own.

According to learned Court Receiver, the second category would comprise of two segments:

- Where such portion of land can be severed or divided and utilized by any other agency.
- Where the unused portion of the land is either at the back of the project or in a corner in such a fashion that such portion of land cannot be separated.

Learned Court Receiver has placed Note dated 01.09.2022 and submitted that certain portions of land from the existing projects can easily be severed. He has also placed before us a Tabular Chart giving details as to the extent of plot, the unutilised portion, the available FSI and what can be utilised to the maximum extent, going by the responses filed by NOIDA and Greater NOIDA.

Learned Court Receiver has concluded his submissions.

List the matter on 11.10.2022 at 2.00 p.m. for submissions of Mr. Ravindra Kumar, learned Senior Advocate.

### PART - II

Learned Court Receiver has brought to our notice certain e-mails addressed by Mr. Joginder Singh, who has been appearing in person.

The interest of the entirety of the flat-buyers is being represented by Mr. M.L. Lahoty and Mr. Kumar Mihir, learned Advocates. Even then, we have always given audience to Mr. Joginder Singh, petitioner-in-person. His submissions, will certainly be looked into by this Court at the appropriate stage but it would not be proper on his part to be addressing learned Court Receiver and the NBCC in the manner that he has done.

We have asked Mr. Joginder Singh to refrain from sending such e-mails, which suggestion, we must record, he has readily accepted.

## PART - III

Re.: <u>IA No..141201 of 2019 – For Intervention/ Direction (Vol. No.Z-226)</u>; and, <u>IA Nos.155928 and 155931 of 2021 – For Intervention/Direction (Vol. No.Z-377)</u>

Mr. M.L. Lahoty, learned Advocate mentioned these Interlocutory Applications.

These applications shall be considered on 11.10.2022.

## PART - IV

All the remaining Interlocutory Applications on Board are adjourned to 11.10.2022 at 2.00 p.m.

(MUKESH NASA) AR-cum-PS (VIRENDER SINGH)
BRANCH OFFICER