

ITEM NO.501

COURT NO.1

SECTION PIL-W

S U P R E M E C O U R T O F I N D I A
R E C O R D O F P R O C E E D I N G S

Writ Petition(s) (Civil) No(s).494/2012

JUSTICE K.S.PUTTASWAMY (RETD) AND ANR.

Petitioner(s)

VERSUS

UNION OF INDIA AND ORS.

Respondent(s)

([FOR FURTHER HEARING] IA No.141212/2017-impleading party and IA No.141215/2017-CLARIFICATION/DIRECTION and IA No.5311/2018-impleading party and IA No.5312/2018-CLARIFICATION/DIRECTION and IA No.5890/2018-INTERVENTION APPLICATION and IA No.10105/2018-INTERVENTION APPLICATION and IA No.10355/2018-impleading party and IA No.13628/2018-impleading party and IA No.24406/2018-INTERVENTION APPLICATION) WITH T.C. (C) No.151/2013 (XVI-A) T.C. (C) No.152/2013 (XVI-A) W.P. (C) No.833/2013 (PIL-W) W.P. (C) No.829/2013 (PIL-W) (and IA No.22171/2018-INTERVENTION APPLICATION and IA No.22174/2018-PERMISSION TO APPEAR AND ARGUE IN PERSON) T.P. (C) No.1797/2013 (XVI-A) W.P. (C) No.932/2013 (PIL-W) T.P. (C) No.1796/2013 (XVI-A) CONMT.PET. (C) No.144/2014 In W.P. (C) No.494/2012 (PIL-W) T.P. (C) No.313/2014 (XVI-A) T.P. (C) No.312/2014 (XVI-A) SLP(Cr1) No.2524/2014 (II-A) W.P. (C) No.37/2015 (PIL-W) W.P. (C) No.220/2015 (PIL-W) CONMT.PET. (C) No.674/2015 In W.P. (C) No.829/2013 (PIL-W) T.P. (C) No.921/2015 (XVI-A) CONMT.PET. (C) No.470/2015 In W.P. (C) No.494/2012 (PIL-W) W.P. (C) No.231/2016 (PIL-W) (FOR ON IA 1/2016(DIRECTION) FOR ON IA 2/2016(PERMISSION TO AMEND WRIT PETITION AND RAISING ADDITIONAL GROUNDS) CONMT.PET. (C) No.444/2016 In W.P. (C) No.494/2012 (PIL-W) CONMT.PET. (C) No.608/2016 In W.P. (C) No.494/2012 (PIL-W) W.P. (C) No.797/2016 (PIL-W) (FOR [PERMISSION TO FILE ANNEXURES] ON IA 4/2016 FOR [DIRECTIONS] ON IA 5/2017 FOR STAY APPLICATION ON IA 6/2017) CONMT.PET. (C) No.844/2017 In W.P. (C) No.494/2012 (PIL-W) W.P. (C) No.342/2017 (PIL-W) (FOR INTERIM PRAYERS FOR GRANT OF INTERIM RELIEF ON IA 1/2017 and IA No.129017/2017-impleading party and IA No.129021/2017-CLARIFICATION/DIRECTION and IA

No.129027/2017-impleading party and IA
 No.129032/2017-CLARIFICATION/DIRECTION and IA
 No.1551/2018-impleading party and IA No.6537/2018-INTERVENTION APPLICATION and IA No.6666/2018-INTERVENTION APPLICATION)
 W.P. (C)No.372/2017
 W.P. (C) No.841/2017 (X)
 (FOR ADMISSION and IA No.119235/2017-AMENDMENT OF THE PETITION)
 W.P. (C) No.1058/2017 (PIL-W)
 W.P. (C) No.966/2017 (PIL-W)
 (FOR ADMISSION and IA No.102155/2017-GRANT OF INTERIM RELIEF)
 W.P. (C) No.1014/2017 (PIL-W)
 (FOR ADMISSION and I.R. and IA No.107091/2017-GRANT OF INTERIM RELIEF and IA No.122999/2017-impleading party)
 W.P. (C) No.1002/2017 (PIL-W)
 W.P. (C) No.1056/2017 (X)
 (and IA No.6196/2018-PERMISSION TO FILE ADDITIONAL DOCUMENTS)
 CONMT.PET. (C) No.34/2018 in W.P. (C) No.1014/2017 (PIL-W)
 (In W.P. (C)No.1014/2017, For admission Contempt. Pet. (C)no.34/2018 is to be shown in W.P.. (C)No.1014/2017)

Date : 10-04-2018 These petitions were called on for hearing today.

CORAM :

HON'BLE THE CHIEF JUSTICE
 HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE A.K. SIKRI
 HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE A.M. KHANWILKAR
 HON'BLE DR. JUSTICE D.Y. CHANDRACHUD
 HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE ASHOK BHUSHAN

For Petitioner(s) Mr.K.V.Vishwanathan, Sr.Adv.
 (In WP(C) 833/13) Ms.Vrinda Bhandari, Adv.
 Mr.N.Sai Vinod, Adv.
 Mr.Shadan Farasat, AOR

In WP(C)1056/17 Mr.K.V.Vishwanathan, Sr.Adv.
 Ms.Vrinda Bhandari, Adv.
 Mr.Gautam Bhatia, Adv.
 Mr.N.Sai Vinod, Adv.
 Mr.T.V.S. Raghavendra Sreyas, AOR

Mr.Shyam Divan, Sr. Adv.
 Mr.Pratap Venugopal, Adv.
 Ms.Surekha Raman, Adv.
 Mr.Anuj Sarma, Adv.
 Ms.Niharika, Adv.
 Ms.Kanika Kalaiyarasan, Adv.
 for M/s.K J John And Co., Adv. [AOR]

In WP(C)932/13 Mr.Shyam Diwan, Sr.Adv.
 Dr.Abhishek Atrey, AOR
 Mr.Ravinder Lokhande, Adv.
 Ms.Vidyottma, Adv.

Mr.Prasanna S., Adv.
Ms.Stuti Vatsa, Adv.
Mr.Kumar Anurag Singh, Adv.
Mr.Priyam Lizmary Cherian, Adv.
Mr.Upasan Garnaik, Adv.
Mr.Kumar Shivam, Adv.
Mr.Anando Mukherjee, AOR

Mr. Rahul Narayan, AOR

In WP(C)No.494/12 Mr.Anish Kumar Gupta, AOR
Mr.Avdhesh Kumar Singh, Adv.
Mr.Rajendra Kumar Singh, Adv.
Ms.Rita Gupta, Adv.
Ms.Deepshikha Bharati, Adv.
Ms.Harsha, Adv.

Ms.Aishwarya Bhati, AOR
Mr.Jaideep Singh, Adv.
Mr.Anirben Sen, Adv.
Mr.Gopal Thiruman, Adv.
Mr.Pavan Bhushan, Adv.
Mr.Jayavardhan Singh, Adv.
Mr.Vaidruti Mishra, Adv.
Mr.Vishwajeet Singh, Adv.
Mr.Chitrangda Rastravara, Adv.

Mr.Prashant Bhushan, AOR

In WP(C)No.231/16 Mr.Muhammad Ali Khan, Adv.
Mr.R.V.Prabhat, Adv.
Mr.Vikramaditya Singh, Adv.
Mr.Abishek Jebraj, Adv.
Mr.Omar Hooda, Adv.
Mr.Jaspal Singh, Adv.
Mr.Rajesh Inamdar, Adv.
Ms.N.Nasir, Adv.
Ms.Prianka Rao, Adv.
Mr.Gaurav Gupta, Adv.
Mr.Gautam Talukdar, AOR

Mr.Vipin Nair, AOR

Ms.Jyoti Mendiratta, AOR

Ms.Archana Pathak Dave, AOR

In T.C. (C)No.151/13 Mr.P.R.Kovilan, Adv.
Mrs.Geetha Kovilan, Adv.
Mr.V.Vasudevan, Adv.

Mr.Pranaya Kumar Mohapatra, AOR

In WP(C) 1014/17

Mr.Apar Gupta, Adv.
Mr.Deepayan Mandal, AOR
Mr.Rahul Unnikrishnan, Adv.

Petitioner-in-person

Ms.Anindita Pujari, Adv.
Ms.Kavita Bhardwaj, Adv.

Mr.Koshy John, Adv.
Mr.Md.Nizam Pasha, Adv.
Ms.Anusha Nagarajan, Adv.
Mr.Adit Pujari, Adv.
Mrs.Pragya Baghel, AOR
Ms.Ranjeeta Rohatgi, Adv.
Ms.Santen Doma, Adv.

In WP(C) No.841/17

Mr.Suhaan Mukerji, Adv.
Mr.Harsh Hiroo Gursani, Adv.
Ms.Astha Sharma, Adv.

For Respondent(s)
Applicant(s)

Mr. K.K. Venugopal, AG
Mr.Tushar Mehta, ASG
Mr.S.S.Shamshery, Adv.
Ms.Shradha Deshmukh, Adv.
Mr. Rajat Nair, Adv.
Mr.R.Balasubramaniam, Adv.
Mr.Raj Bahadur, Adv.
Mr.Harish V.Shenkar, Adv.
Ms.Rukmani Bobde, Adv.
Mr.M.K.Maroria, Adv.
Mr. Zoheb Hossain, AOR
Ms. Ankur Talwar, Adv.
Ms.Charanya L.,Adv.
Mr.Rohit Bhat, Adv.
Mr. Kanu Aggarwal, Adv.
Ms. Adeeba Mujahid, Adv.
Mr. Rajendra Dangwal, Adv.
Mr. Piyush Goyal, Adv.
Mr. Palash Maheshwari, Adv.
Mr.Fahad M.Khan, Adv.
Mr.Vivek Gurnani, Adv.
Mr.Ashok Mathur, Adv.
Ms.Priyanka Walesha, Adv.
Ms.Aarti Sharma, Adv.
Mr.Akshay Amritanshu, Adv.
Mrs.Anil Katiyar, AOR

For State of Kerala Mr. Nishe Rajan Shonker, Adv.
Mrs. Annu K. Joy, Adv.

Mr. Manav Vohra, Adv.
 Mr. Krishna Dev J., Adv.
 Mr. Mohammed Sadique T.A., Adv.
 Ms.Svadha Shankar, Adv.
 Mr. Amith Krishnan, Adv.
 Mr.Anwar Alam, Adv.

For State of Guj. Mr.Rakesh Dwivedi, Sr.Adv.
 Mr.Zoheb Hussain, Adv.
 Ms.Sansriti Pathak, Adv.
 Ms.Hemantika Wahi, AOR
 Ms.Shodhika Sharma, Adv.
 Ms.Apoorva Garg, Adv.

In WP(C) 932/13 & Mr.Jayant Bhushan, Sr. Adv.
 WP(C) 37/15 Mr.Kuldeep S. Parihar, Adv.
 Mr.H. S. Parihar, AOR
 Mr.Ketan Paul, Adv.

In IA 6537/18 & Mr.P.V.Surendra Nath, Sr.Adv.
 IA 6666/18 in Ms.Resmitha R.Chandran, Adv.
 WP(C) 342/17 Ms.Lekha Sudhakaran, Adv.

For State of Ms.Aruna Mathur, Adv.
 Sikkim Mr.Avneesh Arputham, Adv.
 Ms.Anuradha Arputham, Adv.
 Ms.Simran Jeet, Adv.
 For M/S.Arputham Aruna And Co, AOR

Mr. E. C. Agrawala, AOR

For State of Mr. Edward Belho, AAG
 Nagaland Ms. K. Enatoli Sema, Adv.
 Mr. Amit Kumar Singh, Adv.
 Mr. K. Luikang Michael, Adv.
 Mr.Z.H.Isaac Haiding, Adv.

M/S. Lawyer S Knit & Co, AOR

M/s. Meharia & Company, Adv. [AOR]

Mr.Sai Krishna Rajagopal, Adv.
 Mr.Julien George, Adv.
 Ms.Arundhati Gopal, Adv.
 Mr.Arjun Ranganathan, Adv.
 Ms.Vaneesha Jain, Adv.
 Mr.Nikhil Nayyar, Adv.

Mr.Milind Kumar, AOR

Mr. M. Shoeb Alam, AOR
 Ms.Fauzia Shakil, Adv.

Mr.Ujjwal Singh, Adv.
Mr.Mojahid Karim Khan, Adv.

Mr.Dinkar Kalra, AOR

Mr.Gopal Singh, AOR

Ms.Rashmi Singhanian, AOR

For State of
Telangana Mr.S. Udaya Kumar Sagar, AOR
Mr.Mrityunjai Singh, Adv.

For State of
Jharkhand Mr.Tapesh Kumar Singh, AOR
Mohd.Waquas, Adv.
Mr.Aditya Pratap Singh, Adv.

Mr.Jayesh Gaurav, Adv.
Mr.Ratan Kr.Choudhuri, Adv.

Mr.Gopal Sankaranarayanan, Adv.
Ms.Savita Singh, AOR
Ms.Veera Mahuli, Adv.
Mr.Shrutunjay Bhardwaj, Adv.

Mr.Jayant Mohan, AOR

For TRAI Mr.Sanjay Kapur, AOR
Ms. Megha Karnwal, Adv.
Ms. Mansi Kapur, Adv.
Ms. Shubhra Kapur, Adv.

For State of
Karnataka Mr. Devadatt Kamat, Addl. Adv. Gen.
Mr. Joseph Aristotle S., Adv.
Mrs. Priya Aristotle, Adv.
Mr. Rajesh Inamdar, Adv.
Mr. Javedur Rehman, Adv.
Mr. Aditya Bhat, Adv.

For State of
Meghalaya Mr.Ranjan Mukherjee, AOR
Mr.Danielstone Lyngdoh, Adv.

For State of
Mizoram Mr.K.N. Madhusoodhanan, Adv.
Ms.Nitya Madhusoodhanan, Adv.
Mr.T. G. Narayanan Nair, AOR

For Govt. of
Puducherry Mr.V. G. Pragasam, AOR
Mr.S.Prabu Ramasubramanian, Adv.
Mr.S.Manuraj, Adv.

Mr.Jagjit Singh Chhabra, AOR

For State of Mr.Jatinder Kumar Bhatia, Adv.

Uttarakhand Mr.Ashutosh Kumar Sharma, Adv.
Mr.Manish Vashishtha, AOR

For State of Haryana Mr. Anil Grover, AAG
Ms.Noopur Singhal, Adv.
Mr. Shivam Kumar, Adv.
Mr. Sanjay Kumar Visen, AOR

For UT of Andaman & Nicobar Admn. Mr. Bhupesh Narula, Adv.
Mr. K.V. Jagdishvaran, Adv.
Mrs. G. Indira, Adv.
Ms.Radhika Chautervedi, Adv.
Mr.Hitesh Kumar Sharma, Adv.
Mr.S.K.Rajora, Adv.
Dr.(Mrs.)Vipin Gupta, Adv.

For State of A.P. Mr. Guntur Prabhakar, Adv.
Ms.Pruna Singh, Adv.
Ms.Ruchi Kohli, AOR

In I.A.No.32/15 In WP(C)No.494/12 Mr.S.Mukherjee, Adv.
Mr.Manoj K. Mishra, AOR
Mr.Umesh Dubey, Adv.
Mr.Ashish Kumar Mishra, Adv.
Mr.Jafar Imam Naqvi, Adv.
Mr.Varinder Kumar Sharma, AOR
Mr.Sanjeev Kumar, Adv.
Mohd.Shahid Hussain, Adv.
Mr.Aniruddha P. Mayee, AOR
Mr.Garvesh Kabra, AOR
Mr.Harish Pandey, AOR
Mr.Ashok Mathur, Adv.
Mr.R.Sudhinder, Adv.
Mr.Saumya Mehrotra, Adv.
Ms.Amrita Sarkar, Adv.
Mr.Anip Sachthey, AOR
Ms.Anitha Shenoy, AOR

For State of W.B. Mr.Chanchal Kumar Ganguli, AOR
Intervenor-in-person, AOR

Mr.Amit Sharma, AOR

Applicant-in-person

Ms.Pallavi Pratap, AOR

Mr.K.V.Vijayakumar, Adv.
Ms.Maitreyee Mishra, Adv.
Mr.K.V.Ram Kumar, Adv.

Mr.Jogy Scaria, AOR

In TP(C)1796/13

Mr.Wills Mathews, Adv.
Mr.Shaji Sebastian, Adv.
Mr.Rabin Majumder, AOR

Mr.Harsh Kaushik, AOR

Mr.K. R. Sasiprabhu, AOR

Dr.Lalit Bhasin, Adv.
Ms.Nina Gupta, Adv.
Ms.Shireen Shukla, Adv.
Ms.Palak Chadha, Adv.
Mr. Mudit Sharma, AOR

Mr. M. P. Vinod, AOR

For Intervenor
In IA 5890/18

Syed Jafar Alam, Adv.
Ms.Shivani Khandekar, Adv.

For State of
Manipur

Mr.Leishangthem Roshmani Kh., Adv.
Ms.Maibam Babina, Adv.

Mr.Fuzail Ahmad Ayyubi, Adv.

For State of Pb.

Mr.Karan Bharihoke, Adv.

Ms.Aparna Bhat, Adv.
Ms.Joshita M.Pai, Adv.

In IA 10105/18

Mr.Jawahar Raja, Adv.
Mr.Pukhrambam Ramesh Kumar, Adv.
Mr.Chinmay Kanojia, Adv.
Ms.Rahat Sharma, Adv.

For State of
Assam

Mr.Shuvodeep Roy, Adv.
Mr.Sayooj Mohandas, Adv.

Mr.Shuvodeep Roy, Adv.
Mr.Rituraj Biswas, Adv.

For State of Mr.Anil Shrivastav, Adv.
Arunachal Pradesh Mr.Rituraj Biswas, Adv.

Mr.Sriram P., Adv.
Ms.Khushbu Jain, Adv.
Mr.Vishnu Shankar, Adv.
Ms.Athira G.Nair, Adv.

In WP(C) No.494/12 Mr.Suhaan Mukerji, Adv.
 Mr.Harsh Hiroo Gursani, Adv.
 Ms.Astha Sharma, Adv.

UPON hearing the counsel the Court made the following
O R D E R

Mr.K.K.Venugopal, learned Attorney General for India
concluded his arguments. Thereafter, Mr.Tushar Mehta, learned
Additional Solicitor General commenced his arguments, which
remained inconclusive.

Let the matter be listed on 11.04.2018 for further
hearing.

(Chetan Kumar)
Court Master

(H.S.Parasher)
Assistant Registrar