IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

PRESENT

THE HONOURABLE MR. JUSTICE A.MUHAMED MUSTAQUE

æ

THE HONOURABLE MR. JUSTICE S.MANU

THURSDAY, THE 4TH DAY OF JULY 2024 / 13TH ASHADHA, 1946

LA.APP. NO. 105 OF 2014

AGAINST THE JUDGMENT AND DECREE DATED 30.09.2013 IN LAR NO.1 OF 2011 OF SUB COURT, CHERTHALA

APPELLANT/2nd RESPONDENT:

THE COMMISSIONER, TRAVANCORE DEVASWOM BOARD OFFICE OF THE DEVASWOM COMMISSIONER, NANTHANCODE, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM.

BY ADVS.

P.G.PARAMESWARA PANICKER (SR.)

P.GOPAL

SHRI.G.BIJU, SC, TRAVANCORE DEVASWOM BOARD

SRI.G.SANTHOSH KUMAR - SC

RESPONDENTS/CLAIMANT & RESPONDENT No.1:

- 1 SUMATHIKUTTY AMMA
 D/O. KAMALAKSHI AMMA, KOTTARATHIL, THURAVOOR SOUTH
 VILLAGE, THURAVOOR SOUTH MURI.
- 2 STATE OF KERALA
 REPRSENTED BY THE SPECIAL TAHSILDAR (GENERAL),
 ALAPPUZHA.

R1 BY ADVS.SRI.BINU PAUL SRI.SHAJI THOMAS SRI.T.V.VINU

R2 BY SR.GOVERNMENT PLEADER SRI.T.K.SHAJAHAN

2

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

PRESENT

THE HONOURABLE MR. JUSTICE A.MUHAMED MUSTAQUE

THE HONOURABLE MR. JUSTICE S.MANU

THURSDAY, THE 4TH DAY OF JULY 2024 / 13TH ASHADHA, 1946

LA.APP. NO. 1 OF 2024

AGAINST THE JUDGMENT AND DECREE DATED 31.01.2018 IN LAR NO.5 OF 2015 OF SUB COURT, CHERTHALA

APPELLANT/2nd RESPONDENT:

THE COMMISSIONER

TRAVANCORE DEVASWOM BOARD, DEVASWOM HEAD QUARTERS, NANTHANCODE, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695003.

BY ADV G. SANTHOSH KUMAR -SC

RESPONDENTS/CLAIMANTS & 1st RESPONDENT:

- A.J.PAUL
 - S/O A.J.JOSEPH, ARACKAPARAMBIL , PADINJATTUMKARA SOUTH MURI, THURAVOOR SOUTH VILLAGE, PIN - 688532
- 2 FRANKY JOSEPH
 - S/O A.J.JOSEPH, ARACKAPARAMBIL , PADINJATTUMKARA SOUTH MURI, THURAVOOR SOUTH VILLAGE, PIN - 688532
- 3 BHAILAL
 - S/O VISWANATHAN, CHONGAMTHARA, PADINJATTUMKARA SOUTH MURI, THURAVOOR SOUTH VILLAGE, PIN - 688532
- 4 STATE OF KERALA
 - REP.BY THE SPECIAL TAHSILDAR L.A. (GENERAL), ALAPPUZHA, PIN - 688001
 - R1, R2 & R3 BY ADVS.BINU V V VEETTIL VALAPPIL S.K.KRISHNAKUMAR (K/694/1995) MANEKSHA D. (K/000478/2005)

R4 BY SR. GOVERNMENT PLEADER SRI.T.K. SHAJAHAN

3

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

PRESENT

THE HONOURABLE MR. JUSTICE A.MUHAMED MUSTAQUE

8

THE HONOURABLE MR. JUSTICE S.MANU

THURSDAY, THE 4TH DAY OF JULY 2024 / 13TH ASHADHA, 1946

LA.APP. NO. 168 OF 2014

AGAINST THE JUDGMENT AND DECREE DATED 30.09.2013 IN LAR NO.1 OF 2011 OF SUB COURT, CHERTHALA

APPELLANT/CLAIMANT:

SUMATHIKUTTY AMMA, D/O. KAMALAKSHI AMMA, KOTTARATHIL, THURAVUR SOUTH VILLAGE, THURAVOOR SOUTH MURI.

BY ADVS.SRI.BINU PAUL SRI.SHAJI THOMAS SRI.T.V.VINU

RESPONDENTS/RESPONDENTS:

- 1 STATE OF KERALA, REPRESENTED BY SPECIAL TAHSILDAR (GENERAL), ALAPPUZHA-688 001.
- COMMISSIONER,
 TRAVANCORE DEVASWOM BOARD, VIKAS BHAVAN,
 THIRUVANANTHAPURAM-695 033.

R1 BY SR.GOVERNMENT PLEADER SRI.T.K.SHAJAHAN

R2 BY ADVS.SRI.P.GOPAL SRI.G.BIJU,SC,TRAVANCORE DEVASWOM BOARD ADV G.SANTHOSH KUMAR -SC

4

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

PRESENT

THE HONOURABLE MR. JUSTICE A.MUHAMED MUSTAQUE

8

THE HONOURABLE MR. JUSTICE S.MANU

THURSDAY, THE 4^{TH} DAY OF JULY 2024 / 13TH ASHADHA, 1946

LA.APP. NO. 208 OF 2020

AGAINST THE JUDGMENT AND DECREE IN LAR NO.1 OF 2015 OF SUB COURT, CHERTHALA

APPELLANTS/CLAIMANTS 1, 2 AND 5:

- 1 SARVOTHAMA KAMMATH S/O. RAMACHANDRA KAMMATH, KOCHU KATTUKALATHIL, PADINJATTUMKARA SOUTH MURI, THIRUMALABHAGAM P.O., THURAVOOR SOUTH VILLAGE, PIN CODE-688 540.
- 2 VISWOTHAMA KAMMATH
 DHANYA NIVAS, VALAMANGALAM NORTH, THURAVOOR SOUTH
 VILLAGE, PIN CODE-688 532.
- PURUSHOTHAMA KAMMATH

 KOCHU KATTUKALATHIL, PADINJATTUMKARA SOUTH MURI,

 THIRUMALABHAGAM P.O., THURAVOOR SOUTH VILLAGE, PRESENTLY

 RESIDING AT KALAPURACKAL, THURAVOOR P.O., 688532.

BY ADVS. J.HARIKUMAR SRI.K.MANOJ CHANDRAN

RESPONDENTS/RESPONDENTS:

- 1 STATE OF KERALA

 REPRESENTED BY THE SPECIAL TAHASILDAR L.A. (GENERAL),
 ALAPPUZHA, PIN-688 001.
- THE COMMISSIONER
 TRAVANCORE DEVASWOM BOARD, NANTHENCODE,
 THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN-695 033.

R1 BY SR.GOVERNMENT PLEADER SRI.T.K.SHAJAHAN
R2 BY ADV G.SANTHOSH KUMAR -SC

5

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

PRESENT

THE HONOURABLE MR. JUSTICE A.MUHAMED MUSTAQUE

8

THE HONOURABLE MR. JUSTICE S.MANU

THURSDAY, THE 4TH DAY OF JULY 2024 / 13TH ASHADHA, 1946

LA.APP. NO. 210 OF 2020

AGAINST THE JUDGMENT AND DECREE IN LAR NO.2 OF 2015 OF SUB COURT, CHERTHALA

APPELLANT/CLAIMANT:

RADHAKRISHNAN UNNI,
AGED 66 YEARS,
S/O PARAMESWARAN UNNI VARIETH VADAKKE MADATHIL,
PADINJATTUMKARA SOUTH MURI, THIRUMALABHAGOM P.O,
THURAVOOR SOUTH, PRESENTLY RESIDING AT 4B, SARAYU
GARDENS, MANAKKAPADY, IRUMPANAM, THRIPUNITHURA, KOCHI682309.

BY ADVS.J.HARIKUMAR SRI.K.MANOJ CHANDRAN

RESPONDENTS/RESPONDENTS:

- 1 STATE OF KERALA, REP BY THE SPECIAL TAHASILDAR L A(GENERAL), ALAPPUZHA PIN-688001.
- THE COMMISSIONER
 TRAVANCORE DEVASWOM BOARD, NANTHENCODE,
 THIRUVANANTHAPURAM-695033.

R1 BY SR.GOVERNMENT PLEADER SRI.T.K.SHAJAHAN
R2 BY ADV G.SANTHOSH KUMAR -SC

6

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

PRESENT

THE HONOURABLE MR. JUSTICE A.MUHAMED MUSTAQUE

8

THE HONOURABLE MR. JUSTICE S.MANU

THURSDAY, THE 4TH DAY OF JULY 2024 / 13TH ASHADHA, 1946

LA.APP. NO. 207 OF 2020

AGAINST THE JUDGMENT AND DECREE IN LAR NO.3 OF 2015 OF SUB COURT, CHERTHALA

RESIDING AT KALAPURACKAL, THURAVOOR P.O,688 532

APPELLANT/CLAIMANT:

PURUSHOTHAMA KAMMATH
KOCHU KATTUKALATHIL, PADINJATTUMKARA SOUTH MURI,
THIRUMALABHAGAM P.O, THURAVOOR SOUTH VILLAGE, PRESENTLY

BY ADVS. J.HARIKUMAR SRI.K.MANOJ CHANDRAN

RESPONDENTS/RESPONDENTS:

- 1 STATE OF KERALA
 REPRESENTED BY THE SPECIAL TAHASILDAR L.A. (GENERAL),
 ALAPPUZHA.
- THE COMMISSIONER,

 TRAVANCORE DEVASWOM BOARD, NANTHENCODE,

 THIRUVANANTHAPURAM.

R1 BY SR.GOVERNMENT PLEADER SRI.T.K.SHAJAHAN R2 BY ADV G.SANTHOSH KUMAR -SC

7

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

PRESENT

THE HONOURABLE MR. JUSTICE A. MUHAMED MUSTAQUE

8

THE HONOURABLE MR. JUSTICE S.MANU

THURSDAY, THE 4^{TH} DAY OF JULY 2024 / 13TH ASHADHA, 1946

LA.APP. NO. 214 OF 2020

AGAINST THE JUDGMENT DATED 21.11.2019 IN LAR NO.4 OF 2015 OF SUB COURT, CHERTHALA

APPELLANTS/CLAIMANTS:

- SURESAN ALIAS P.K.SURESH,
 AGED 53 YEARS
 S/O KRISHNAN MOOSATH, PARVATHY NIVAS (OALIKKARA
 ILLATHU), PADINJATTUMKARA SOUTH MURI, THURAVOOR SOUTH
 VILLAGE, PRESENTLY RESIDING AT PARVATHY NIVAS, HOUSE NO.
 451, THURAVOOR P.O., PIN CODE-688532.
- PRABHAKUTTY,
 AGED 51 YEARS , D/O KRISHNAN MOOSATH, PARVATHY NIVAS
 (OALIKKARA ILLATHU), PADINJATTUMKARA SOUTH MURI,
 THURAVOOR SOUTH VILLAGE, PRESENTLY RESIDING AT PARVATHY
 NIVAS, HOUSE NO. 451, THURAVOOR P.O., PIN CODE-688532.
- MOHANAN,
 AGED 45 YEARS, S/O KRISHNAN MOOSATH, PARVATHY NIVAS
 (OALIKKARA ILLATHU), PADINJATTUMKARA SOUTH MURI,
 THURAVOOR SOUTH VILLAGE, PRESENTLY RESIDING AT PARVATHY
 NIVAS, HOUSE NO. 451, THURAVOOR P.O., PIN CODE-688532.

BY ADV J.HARIKUMAR

RESPONDENTS/RESPONDENTS:

- STATE OF KERALA
 REPRESENTED BY THE SPECIAL TAHASILDAR L.A. (GENERAL),
 ALAPPUZHA-688001.
- THE COMMISSIONER,

 TRAVANCORE DEVASWOM BOARD, NANTHENCODE,

 THIRUVANANTHAPURAM-695033.

R2 BY ADV G.SANTHOSH KUMAR -SC R1 BY SR.GOVERNMENT PLEADER SRI.T.K.SHAJAHAN

8

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

PRESENT

THE HONOURABLE MR. JUSTICE A.MUHAMED MUSTAQUE

ς

THE HONOURABLE MR. JUSTICE S.MANU

THURSDAY, THE 4TH DAY OF JULY 2024 / 13TH ASHADHA, 1946

LA.APP. NO. 110 OF 2023

AGAINST THE JUDGMENT AND DECREE DATED 21.11.2019 IN LAR NO.1 OF 2015 OF SUB COURT, CHERTHALA

APPELLANT/2nd RESPONDENT:

THE COMMISSIONER
TRAVANCORE DEVASWOM BOARD, DEVASWOM HEAD QUARTERS,
NANTHANCODE, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695033
BY ADV G.SANTHOSH KUMAR-SC.

RESPONDENTS/CLAIMANTS & 1st RESPONDENT:

- 1 SARVOTHAMA KAMMATH
 S/O RAMACHANDRA KAMMATH, KOCHU KATTUKALATHIL,
 PADINJATTUMKARA SOUTH MURI, THIRUMALABHAGAM P.O.,
 THURAVOOR SOUTH VILLAGE, PIN 688540
- VISWOTHAMA KAMMATH DHANYA NIVAS, VALAMANGALAM NORTH, THURAVOOR SOUTH VILLAGE, PIN - 688532
- 3 SANTHA BAI (DIED)
 KOCHU KATTUKALATHIL, PADINJATTUKARA .P.O.,
 THIRUMALABHAGAM VILLAGE, PIN 688540
- 4 SREEDEVI KOCHU KATTUKALATHIL, PADINJATTUKARA .P.O., THIRUMALABHAGAM VILLAGE, PIN - 688540
- 5 PURUSHOTHAM KAMMATH
 KOCHU KATTUKALATHIL, PADINJATTUKARA .P.O.,
 THIRUMALABHAGAM VILLAGE, PIN 688540

9

6 STATE OF KERALA REP.BY THE SPECIAL TAHSILDAR L.A. (GENERAL), ALAPPUZHA, PIN - 688001

> R1, R2 & R5 -BY ADVS.K MANOJ CHANDRAN K J. HARIKUMAR (K/000125/1985) P.R.AJITH KUMAR(K/000708/1998) AMMU CHARLES (K/000664/2013) S.A.MANSOOR (PATTANAM) (K/217/1994)

R6 - BY SR. GOVERNMENT PLEADER SRI.T.K. SHAJAHAN

10

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

PRESENT

THE HONOURABLE MR. JUSTICE A.MUHAMED MUSTAQUE

8

THE HONOURABLE MR. JUSTICE S.MANU

THURSDAY, THE 4^{TH} DAY OF JULY 2024 / 13TH ASHADHA, 1946

LA.APP. NO. 115 OF 2023

AGAINST THE JUDGMENT DATED 21.11.2019 IN LAR NO.3 OF 2015 OF SUB COURT, CHERTHALA

APPELLANT/2nd RESPONDENT:

THE COMMISSIONER
TRAVANCORE DEVASWOM BOARD, DEVASWOM HEAD QUARTERS,
NANTHANCODE, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695003

BY ADV G. SANTHOSH KUMAR -SC.

RESPONDENTS/CLAIMANT & 1st RESPONDENT:

- 1 PURUSHOTHAMA KAMATH
 KOCHUKATTUKALATHIL KALAPURACKAL,
 PADINJATTUMKARA SOUTH MURI, THURAVOOR SOUTH VILLAGE,
 PIN 688540
- 2 STATE OF KERALA
 REP. BY THE SPECIAL TAHSILDAR L.A. (GENERAL) ALAPPUZHA,
 PIN 688001

R2 BY SR.GOVERNMENT PLEADER SRI.T.K.SHAJAHAN

11

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

PRESENT

THE HONOURABLE MR. JUSTICE A.MUHAMED MUSTAQUE

8

THE HONOURABLE MR. JUSTICE S.MANU

THURSDAY, THE 4^{TH} DAY OF JULY 2024 / 13TH ASHADHA, 1946

LA.APP. NO. 116 OF 2023

AGAINST THE JUDGMENT AND DECREE DATED 21.11.2019 IN LAR NO.4 OF 2015 OF SUB COURT, CHERTHALA

APPELLANT/2nd RESPONDENT:

THE COMMISSIONER

TRAVANCORE DEVASWOM BOARD, DEVASWOM HEAD QUARTERS, NANTHANCODE, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695003

BY ADV G. SANTHOSH KUMAR -SC

RESPONDENTS/CLAIMANTS & 1st RESPONDENT:

- 1 SURESAN
 - S/O KRISHNA MOOSATH, PARVATHY NIVAS (OALIKKARA ILLATHU), PADINJATTUMKARA SOUTH MURI, THURAVOOR SOUTH VILLAGE, PIN 688540
- 2 PRABHAKUTTY

D/O KRISHNA MOOSATH, PARVATHY NIVAS (OALIKKARA ILLATHU), PADINJATTUMKARA SOUTH MURI, THURAVOOR SOUTH VILLAGE, PIN - 688540

- 3 MOHANAN
 - S/O KRISHNA MOOSATH, PARVATHY NIVAS (OALIKKARA ILLATHU), PADINJATTUMKARA SOUTH MURI, THURAVOOR SOUTH VILLAGE, PIN - 688540
- 4 STATE OF KERALA

REP. BY THE SPECIAL TAHSILDAR L.A. (GENERAL) ALAPPUZHA, PIN - 688001

R1 TO R3 BY ADVS.K MANOJ CHANDRAN K

J.HARIKUMAR(K/000125/1985)
P.R.AJITH KUMAR(K/000708/1998)
AMMU CHARLES(K/000664/2013)
S.A.MANSOOR (PATTANAM) (K/217/1994)

R4 BY SR.GOVERNMENT PLEADER SRI.T.K.SHAJAHAN

12

IN THE HIGH COURT OF KERALA AT ERNAKULAM

PRESENT

THE HONOURABLE MR. JUSTICE A.MUHAMED MUSTAQUE

æ

THE HONOURABLE MR. JUSTICE S.MANU

THURSDAY, THE 4^{TH} DAY OF JULY 2024 / 13TH ASHADHA, 1946

LA.APP. NO. 117 OF 2023

AGAINST THE JUDGMENT AND DECREE DATED 21.11.2019 IN LAR NO.2 OF 2015 OF SUB COURT, CHERTHALA

APPELLANT/2nd RESPONDENT:

THE COMMISSIONER
TRAVANCORE DEVASWOM BOARD, DEVASWOM HEAD QUARTERS,
NANTHANCODE, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM, PIN - 695003

BY ADV G. SANTHOSH KUMAR -SC

RESPONDENTS/CLAIMANT & 1st RESPONDENT:

- 1 RADHAKRISHNAN UNNI S/O PARAMESWARAN UNNI, VARIATH VADKKE MADATHIL, PADINJATTUMKARA SOUTH MURI, THIRUMALABHAGAM P.O., THURAVOOR SOUTH VILLAGE, PIN - 688540
- 2 STATE OF KERALA
 REP. BY THE SPECIAL TAHSILDAR L.A. (GENERAL) ALAPPUZHA,
 PIN 688001

R2 BY SR.GOVERNMENT PLEADER SRI.T.K.SHAJAHAN

w.ecourtsindia.com

L.A.A.Nos.105, 168 of 2014, 207, 208, 210, 214 of 2020, 110, 115, 116, 117 of 2023 & 1 of 2024

13

A.MUHAMED MUSTAQUE & S.MANU, JJ.

L.A.A.Nos.105, 168 of 2014, 207, 208, 210, 214 of 2020, 110, 115, 116, 117 of 2023 & 1 of 2024

Dated this the 04th day of July, 2024

JUDGMENT

A.MUHAMED MUSTAQUE, J.

These appeals were filed by the requisition authorities as well as the claimants. The requisition authority is the Commissioner of Travancore Devaswom Board. The land acquired for the development of Thuravoor was Mahakshethram. Notification under Section 4(1) was issued 14.1.2008. The Land Acquisition Officer awarded on compensation at Rs.74,617 per Are for 'A' category property, which was later enhanced to Rs.1,25,000 per Are. Aggrieved by enhancement Devaswom Board had come up Claimants are also not satisfied with the with appeals. compensation amount awarded.

2. The challenge raised by the Devaswom Board is on the ground that the reference court relied on post-

14

notification documents. This contention is true. In some of the cases parties relied only post-notification documents. However, in L.A.R.No.3/2015 from which L.A.A.No.207/2020 has arisen, the claimant produced documents of the year 2007 as well as 2008. In L.A.R.No.3/2015, document of the year 2007 was marked as Annexure-A4 and the other document immediately after the notification was marked as Annexure-A5. These documents are vital in this matter to determine the compensation.

3. The Commissioner deputed in the matter reported that the land referred to in Annexure-A4 and Annexure-A5 lies close proximity to the acquired land. The Commissioner reported that the distance between the acquired land and the land mentioned in these documents is around 150 metres. The Commissioner also noted that this land is very close to a National Highway, being only 50 metres away from NH and Thuravoor Junction. Annexure-A4 document in LAR No.3/2015 pertains to a small extent of

15

(77 sq.m.) with a sale consideration of over Rs.5,19,480 per Are. However, Annexure-A5 document, which was executed on 7th July, 2008, states that the sale consideration was Rs.3,80,751 per Are. Normally, the Court will not consider post-notification documents as the same may not reflect the true market value of the land as it is a transaction pursuant to post-notification. However, the Court shall consider whether there would be any other impact consequent upon acquiring land pursuant to the notification. In this case, the land was acquired for the development of a temple and not for any other commercial purpose or for any other developmental activity in the locality. Therefore, it cannot be said that the acquisition had an impact on increasing the market value of the land sought. post-notification document is taken into account along with other documents executed prior to the notification, the Court can very well arrive at a conclusion regarding the market value. Although Annexure-A4 relates to a small extent of land, the Court cannot brush aside the market value shown therein, which exceeds Rs.5,00,000/-; whereas Annexure-A5 indicates a value of Rs.3,08,750/-. The Commission report indicates that the land lies in an important locality. Taking note of the totality of the fact, we are of the view that the market value can be fixed at Rs.3,00,000/- (Rupees Three lakh only) per Are.

- 4. Accordingly, we re-fix the market value at Rs.3,00,000/- (Rupees Three lakh only) per Are. Thus, following orders are passed:
 - i) Appeals filed by the Devaswom are dismissed. Appeals filed by the claimants are allowed re-fixing the market value of the land at Rs.3,00,000/- (Rupees Three lakh only) per Are.
 - ii) Court fee paid by the requisition authority in any of the appeals be refunded as they are not bound to pay court fee in the light of the order of this Court dated 12.1.2023 in LA.App.(filing) No.616/2022 and connected

17

cases. The parties will be entitled for all consequential benefits.

iii) All other claims raised by the claimants are rejected.

Sd/-

A.MUHAMED MUSTAQUE, JUDGE

Sd/-**S.MANU, JUDGE**

skj