

GAHC040004652023



**THE GAUHATI HIGH COURT**  
**(HIGH COURT OF ASSAM, NAGALAND, MIZORAM AND ARUNACHAL PRADESH)**  
**(ITANAGAR BENCH)**

**Case No. : IA(C) 58/2023**

1: THE UNION OF INDIA and 3 Ors.  
Ministry of Defence,  
Represented by the Defence Secretary, 101A South Block, New Delhi 110011

2: The Director General of Defence Estates (DGDE)  
Raksha Sampada Bhawan  
Ulaan Baatar Marg  
Delhi Cantonment. PIN 110010

3: The Principal Director of Defence Estates  
Eastern Command (PDDEEC)  
AC 4  
4/1  
Belveder Road  
Alipore  
Kolkata  
West Bengal  
PIN 700027

4: The Defence Estates Officer (DEO)  
Itanagar Circle  
Dist. Papum Pare  
Arunachal Pradesh. Pin 79111

VERSUS

1: Dorjee Khandu Chukla and 7 Ors.  
S/o Shri Pasang Tsering Chukla,  
R/o Vill. Chukla, Dorjeeling, PO/PS Mechuka, Dist. Shi Yomi, Arunachal Pradesh.  
Pin 791003

2: Norbu Tsering Naksang  
S/o Lt. Taling Naksang

R/o Vill. Barangang  
PO/PS Mechuka  
Dist. Shi Yomi  
Arunachal Pradesh. PIN 791003

3:Nyima Chanden Sharjo  
S/o Lt. Sange Dorjee Sharjo

R/o Vill. Mechuka  
PO/PS Mechuka  
Dist. Shi Yomi  
Arunachal Pradesh. Pin 791003

4:Dorjee Dindup Philley  
S/o Sanga Khandu Philley  
Vill. Segong  
PO/PS Mechuka  
Dist. Shi Yomi  
Arunachal Pradesh. Pin 791003

5:Domdi Sona  
S/o Lt. Nim Chanden Sona

Vill Yorni  
PO/PS Mechuka  
Dist. Shi Yomi  
Arunachal Pradesh. Pin 791003

6:Kumar Sona  
S/o Lt. Sange Sona

Vill Yorni  
PO/PS Mechuka  
Dist. Shi Yomi  
Arunachal Pradesh. Pin 791003

(All the above named petitioners/ Respondents are represented by their duly constituted and appointed Power of Attorney holder

namely

Shri Togo Riba

S/o Lt. Nyato Riba

R/o Likabali

Lower Siang District

Arunachal Pradesh. Pin 791125)

7:The Collector cum Deputy Commissioner  
Shi Yomi District  
Tato

Arunachal Pradesh. PIN 791001

8:The Director  
Land Management  
Govt. of Arunachal Pradesh  
Itanagar

**Advocate for the Petitioner** : 1 Y Doloi

**Advocate for the Respondent** : Bomyom Ori

Linked Case : L.A.Appl. 1/2022

1:The Union of India and 3 Ors.  
Ministry of Defence  
Represented by the Defence Secretary  
101A South Block  
New Delhi 110011

2: The Director General  
of Defence Estates (DGDE)  
Raksha Sampada Bhawan  
Ulaan Baatar Marg  
Delhi Cantonment. PIN 110010

3: The Principal Director  
of Defence Estates  
Eastern Command (PDDEEC)  
AC 4  
4/1  
Belveder Road  
Alipore  
Kolkata  
West Bengal. PIN 700027

4: The Defence Estate Officer (DEO)  
Itanagar Circle  
Dist. Papum Pare  
Arunachal Pradesh. PIN 791110  
VERSUS

1:Dorjee Khandu Chukla and 6 Ors.  
S/o Shri Pasang Tsering Chukla

R/o Vill. Chukla  
Dorjeeling  
PO and PS Mechuka  
Dist. Shi Yomi  
Arunachal Pradesh. PIN 791003

2:Norbu Tsering Naksang  
S/o Lt. Taling Naksang

R/o Vill. Barangang

PO and PS Mechuka  
Dist. Shi Yomi  
Arunachal Pradesh.  
PIN 791003

3:Nyima Chanden Sharjo  
S/o Lt. Sange Dorjee Sharjo

R/o Vill. Mechuka

PO and PS Mechuka  
Dist. Shi Yomi  
Arunachal Pradesh. PIN 791003

4:Dorjee Dindup Philley  
S/o Sanga Khandu Philley

Vill Segong  
PO and PS Mechuka  
Dist. Shi Yomi  
Arunachal Pradesh. PIN 791003

5:Domdi Sona  
S/o Lt. Nim Chanden Sona

Vill Yorni  
PO and PS Mechuka  
Dist. Shi Yomi  
Arunachal Pradesh. PIN 791003

6:Kumar Sona  
S/o Lt. Sange Sona

Vill Yorni  
PO and PS Mechuka  
Dist. Shi Yomi

Arunachal Pradesh. PIN 791003

7:The Collector cum Deputy Commissioner  
Shi Yomi District  
Tato  
Arunachal Pradesh. PIN 791001

Advocate for the Petitioner : 1 Y Dolo  
Advocate for the Respondent : GA (AP)

Linked Case : IA(C) 60/2023

1:THE UNION OF INDIA and 3 Ors.  
Ministry of Defence  
Represented by the Defence Secretary  
101A South Block  
New Delhi 110011

2: The Director General of Defence Estates (DGDE)  
Raksha Sampada Bhawan  
Ulaan Baatar Marg  
Delhi Cantonment. PIN 110010

3: The Principal Director of Defence Estates  
Eastern Command (PDDEEC)  
AC 4  
4/1  
Belveder Road  
Alipore  
Kolkata  
West Bengal  
PIN 700027

4: The Defence Estates Officer (DEO)  
Itanagar Circle  
Dist. Papum Pare  
Arunachal Pradesh. PIN 791110  
VERSUS

1:Thinley Sona and 5 Ors.  
S/o Lt. Lhakpa Sona

R/o Vill Singbir

PO/PS Mechuka

Dist. Shi Yomi  
Arunachal Pradesh. Pin 791003

2:Pema Namgey Chukla  
S/o Phinjo Chukla

R/o Vill. Shorangdam

PO/PS Mechuka  
Dist. Shi Yomi  
Arunachal Pradesh. Pin 791003

3:Tenjen Chukla  
S/o Singtung Chukla

R/o Vill Yorni

PO/PS Mechuka  
Dist. Shi Yomi  
Arunachal Pradesh.  
PIN 791003

4:Korma Mindu Goiba  
S/o Late Lera Goiba

Vill. Farge  
PO/PS Mechuka

Dist. Shi Yomi  
Arunachal Pradesh.  
PIN 791003.

(All the above-named petitioners/Respondents are represented by their duly constituted and appointed Power of Attorney holder

namely

Shri Togo Riba

S/o Lt. Nyato Riba

R/o Likabalai

Lower Siang District

Arunachal Pradesh. Pin 791125)

5:The Collector cum Deputy Commissioner  
Shi Yomi District  
Tato  
Arunachal Pradesh. PIN 791001

6:The Director  
Land Management  
Govt. of Arunachal Pradesh

Itanagar.

Advocate for the Petitioner : 1 Y Doloi

Advocate for the Respondent : Bomyom Ori

Linked Case : L.A.Appl. 3/2023

1:Dorjee Khandu Chukla and 5 Ors.

Son of Shri Pasang Tsering Chukla

a Permanent Resident of Village Chukla

Dorjeeling

PO and PS Mechuka

Dist. Shi Yomi

Arunachal Pradesh

PIN 791003

2: Norbu Tsering Naksang

Son of Late Taling Naksang

A Permanent Resident of Village Barangang

PO and PS Mechuka

District Shi Yomi

Arunachal Pradesh

PIN 791003

3: Nyima Chanden Sharjo

Son of Late Sange Dorjee Sharjo

A Permanent Resident of Village Mechuka

PO and PS Mechuka

District Shi Yomi

Arunachal Pradesh

PIN 791003

4: Dorjee Dindup Philley

Son of Shri Sanga Khandu Philley

a Permanent Resident of Village Segong

PO and PS Mechuka

District Shi Yomi

Arunachal Pradesh

PIN 791003

5: Domdi Sona

Son of Late Nima Chanden Sona

A Permanent Resident of Village Yorni  
PO and PS Mechuka  
District Shi Yomi  
Arunachal Pradesh  
PIN 791003

6: Kumar Sona  
Son of Late Sange Sona

A Permanent Resident of Village Yorni  
PO and PS Mechuka  
District Shi Yomi  
Arunachal Pradesh  
PIN 791003  
VERSUS

1:The Collector cum Deputy Commissioner and 4 Ors.  
Shi Yomi District  
Tato  
Arunachal Pradesh  
PIN 791001

2:The Union of India  
Ministry of Defence

Represented by the Defence Secretary  
101A South Block  
New Delhi 110011

3:The Director General of Defence Estates (DGDE)  
Raksha Sampada Bhawan  
Ulaan Baatar Marg  
Delhi Cantonment  
PIN 110010

4:The Principal Director of Defence Estates  
Eastern Command (PDDEEC)  
AC 4  
Belveder Road  
Alipore  
Kolkata  
West Bengal  
PIN 700027

5:The Defence Estates Officer (DEO)  
Itanagar  
District Papum Pare

Arunachal Pradesh  
PIN 791110

Advocate for the Petitioner : Chorpok Modi  
Advocate for the Respondent : GA (AP)

Linked Case : L.A.Appl. 1/2023

1:Thinley Sona and 2 Ors.  
Son of Late Lhakpa Sona

A Permanent Resident of Village Singbir  
PO and PS Mechuka  
Dist. Shi Yomi  
Arunachal Pradesh. PIN 791003

2: Pema Namgey Chukla  
A GED

Son of Phinjo Chukla  
a permanent resident of Village Shorangdam  
PO and PS Mechuka  
District Shi Yomi  
Arunachal Pradesh  
PIN 791003

3: Tenjen Chukla  
Son of Singtung Chukla

A Permanent Resident of Village Yorni  
PO and PS Mechuka  
District Shi Yomi  
Arunachal Pradesh  
PIN 791003

4: Karma Mindu Goliba  
Son of Late Lera Goiba

a Permanent Resident of Village Farge  
PO and PS Mechuka  
District Shi Yomi  
Arunachal Pradesh  
PIN 791003  
VERSUS

1:The Collector cum Deputy Commissioner and 4 Ors.

Shi Yomi District  
Tato  
Arunachal Pradesh  
PIN 791001

2:The Union of India  
Ministry of Defence

Represented by the Defence Secretary  
101A South Block  
New Delhi 110011

3:The Director General Defence Estates (DGDE)  
Raksha Sampada Bhawan  
Ulaan Baatar Marg  
Delhi Cantonment  
PIN 110010

4:The Principal Director of Defence Estates  
Eastern Command (PDDEEC)  
AC 4  
Belveder Road  
Alipore  
Kolkata  
West Bengal  
PIN 700027

5:The Defence Estates Officer (DEO)  
Itanagar  
District Papum Pare  
Arunachal Pradesh  
PIN 791110

Advocate for the Petitioner : Chorpok Modi  
Advocate for the Respondent : GA (AP)

Linked Case : L.A.Appl. 3/2022

1:The Union of India and 3 Ors.  
Ministry of Defence Secretary  
101A South Block  
New Delhi 110011

2: The Director General  
of Defence Estates (DGDE)  
Raksha Sampada Bhawan

Ulaan Baatar Marg  
Delhi Cantonment. PIN 110010

3: The Principal Director  
of Defence Estates. Eastern Command (PDDEEC)  
AC 4  
4/1  
Belveder Road  
Alipore  
Kolkata  
West Bengal. PIN 70002

4: The Defence Estate Officer (DEO)  
Itanagar Circle  
Dist. Papum Pare  
Arunachal Pradesh. PIN 791110  
VERSUS

1:Thinley Sona and 4 Ors.  
S/o Lt. Lhakpa Sona

R/o Vill. Singbir

PO and PS Mechuka  
Dist. Shi Yomi  
Arunachal Pradesh. PIN 791003

2:Pema Namgey Chukla  
S/o Phinjo Chukla

R/o Vill Shorangdam

PO and PS Mechuka  
Dist. Shi Yomi  
Arunachal Pradesh.  
PIN 791003

3:Tenjen Chukla  
S/o Singtung Chukla

R/o Vill. Yorni  
PO and PS Mechuka. Dist. Shi Yomi  
Arunachal Pradesh. PIN 791003

4:Korma Mindu Goiba  
S/o Late Lera Goiba

R/o Vill Farge

PO and PS Mechuka  
Dist. Shi Yomi  
Arunachal Pradesh.  
PIN 791003

5: The Collector cum Deputy Commissioner  
Shi Yomi District  
Tato  
Arunachal Pradesh. PIN 791001

Advocate for the Petitioner : 1 Y Dolo  
Advocate for the Respondent : GA (AP)

Linked Case : L.A.Appl. 2/2023

1: Libo Ragmuk and 2 Ors.  
Son of Late Tabin Ragmuk

A Permanent Resident of Village  
Talo  
PO and PS Tato  
District Shi Yomi  
Arunachal Pradesh  
PIN 791001

2: Eling Ragmuk  
Son of Late Tabin Ragmuk

A Permanent Resident of Village Tato  
PO and PS Tato  
District Shi Yomi  
Arunachal Pradesh  
PIN 791001

3: Raju Diru  
Son of Tachuk Diru

A Permanent Resident of Village Tato  
PO and PS Tato  
District Shi Yomi  
Arunachal Pradesh  
PIN 791001

4: Tajen Diru  
Son of Libo Diru

a Permanent Resident of Village Tato  
PO and PS Tato  
District Shi Yomi  
Arunachal Pradesh  
PIN 791001  
VERSUS

1:The Collector cum Deputy Commissioner and 4 Ors.  
Shi Yomi District  
Tato  
Arunachal Pradesh  
PIN 791001

2:The Union of India  
Ministry of Defence

Represented by the Defence Secretary  
101A South Block  
New Delhi 110011

3:The Director General Defence Estates (DGDE)  
Raksha Sampada Bhawan  
Ulaan Baatar Marg  
Delhi Cantonment  
PIN 110010

4:The Principal Director of Defence Estates  
Eastern Command (PDDEEC)  
AC 4  
Belveder Road  
Alipore  
Kolkata  
West Bengal  
PIN 700027

5:The Defence Estates Officer (DEO)  
Itanagar  
District Papum Pare  
Arunachal Pradesh  
PIN 791110

Advocate for the Petitioner : Chorpok Modi  
Advocate for the Respondent : GA (AP)

Linked Case : L.A.Appl. 2/2022

1:The Union of India and 3 Ors.  
Ministry of Defence

Represented by the Defence Secretary  
101A South Block  
New Delhi 110011

2: The Director General  
of Defence Estates (DGDE)  
Raksha Sampada Bhawan  
Ulaan Baatar Marg  
Delhi Cantonment. PIN 110010

3: The Principal Director  
of Defence Estates. Eastern Command (PDDEEC)  
AC 4  
4/1  
Belveder Road  
Alipore  
Kolkata  
West Bengal. PIN 700027

4: The Defence Estate Officer (DEO)  
Itanagar Circle  
Dist. Papum Pare  
Arunachal Pradesh. PIN 791110  
VERSUS

1:Libo Ragmuk and 4 Ors.  
S/o Libo Ragmuk

R/o Vill. Talo  
PO and PS Tato  
Dist. Shi Yomi  
Arunachal Pradesh.  
PIN 791001

2:Eling Ragmuk  
S/o Late Tabin Ragmuk

R/o Vill Talo  
PO and PS Tato  
Dist. Shi Yomi  
Arunachal Pradesh. PIN 791001

3:Raju Diru  
S/o Tachuk Diru

R/o Vill Talo  
PO and PS Tato  
Dist. Shi Yomi  
Arunachal Pradesh. PIN 791001

4:Tajen Diru  
S/o Libu Diru

R/o Vill Talo  
PO and PS Tato  
Dist. Shi Yomi  
Arunachal Pradesh. PIN 791001

5:The Collector cum Deputy Commissioner  
Shi Yomi District  
Tato  
Arunachal Pradesh. PIN 791001

Advocate for the Petitioner : 1 Y Doloi  
Advocate for the Respondent : GA (AP)

Linked Case : IA(C) 240/2022

1:The Union of India and 3 Ors.  
Ministry of Defence Secretary  
101A South Block  
New Delhi 110011

2: The Director General  
of Defence Estates (DGDE)  
Raksha Sampada Bhawan  
Ulaan Baatar Marg  
Delhi Cantonment. PIN 110010

3: The Principal Director  
of Defence Estates. Eastern Command (PDDEEC)  
AC 4  
4/1  
Belveder Road  
Alipore  
Kolkata  
West Bengal. PIN 70002

4: The Defence Estate Officer (DEO)  
Itanagar Circle  
Dist. Papum Pare

Arunachal Pradesh. PIN 791110  
VERSUS

1:Thinley Sona and 4 Ors.  
S/o Lt. Lhakpa Sona  
R/o Vill. Singbir  
PO and PS Mechuka  
Dist. Shi Yomi  
Arunachal Pradesh. PIN 791003

2:Pema Namgey Chukla  
S/o Phinjo Chukla  
R/o Vill Shorangdam  
PO and PS Mechuka  
Dist. Shi Yomi  
Arunachal Pradesh. PIN 791003

3:Tenjen Chukla  
S/o Singtung Chukla  
R/o Vill. Yorni  
PO and PS Mechuka. Dist. Shi Yomi  
Arunachal Pradesh. PIN 791003

4:Korma Mindu Goiba  
S/o Late Lera Goiba  
R/o Vill Farge  
PO and PS Mechuka  
Dist. Shi Yomi  
Arunachal Pradesh. PIN 791003

5:The Collector cum Deputy Commissioner  
Shi Yomi District  
Tato  
Arunachal Pradesh. PIN 791001

Advocate for the Petitioner : 1 Y Doloi  
Advocate for the Respondent : GA (AP)

Linked Case : IA(C) 59/2023

1:THE UNION OF INDIA and 3 Ors.  
Represented by the Defence Secretary  
101A South Block  
New Delhi 110011.

2: The Director General of Defence Estates (DGDE)

Raksha Sampada Bhawn  
Ulaan Baatar Marg  
Delhi Cantonment. PIN 110010

3: The Principal Director of Defence Estates  
Eastern Command (PDDEEC)  
AC 4  
4/1  
Belveder Road  
Alipore  
Kolkata  
West Bengal  
PIN 700027

4: The Defence Estates Officer (DEO)  
Itanagar Circle  
Dist. Papum Pare  
Arunachal Pradesh. PIN 791110  
VERSUS

1:Libo Ragmuk and 5 Ors.  
S/o Taduk Ragmuk

R/o Vill Talo  
PO/PS Tato  
Dist. Shi Yomi  
Arunachal Pradesh. PIN 791001

2:Eling Ragmuk  
S/o Late Tabin Ragmuk

R/o Vill. Talo  
PO/PS Tato  
Dist. Shi Yomi  
Arunachal Pradesh. PIN 791001

3:Raju Diru  
S/o Tachuk Diru

R/o Vill Talo  
PO/PS Tato  
Dist. Shi Yomi  
Arunachal Pradesh. PIN 791001

4:Tajen Diru  
S/o Libu Diru

R/o Vill Talo

PO/PS Tato  
Dist. Shi Yomi  
Arunachal Pradesh. PIN 791001

5:The Collector cum Deputy Commissioner  
Shi Yomi District  
Tato  
Arunachal Pradesh. PIN 791001

6:The Director  
Land Management  
Govt. of Arunachal Pradesh  
Itanagar.

Advocate for the Petitioner : 1 Y Doloi  
Advocate for the Respondent : Bomyom Ori

Linked Case : IA(C) 237/2022

1:The Union of India and 3 Ors.  
Represented by the Defence Secretary  
101A South Block  
New Delhi 110011

2: The Director General  
of Defence Estates (DGDE)  
Raksha Sampada Bhawan  
Ulaan Baatar Marg  
Delhi Cantonment. PIN 110010

3: The Principal Director  
of Defence Estates  
Eastern Command (PDDEEC)  
AC 4  
4/1 Belveder Road  
Alipore  
Kolkata  
West Bengal. PIN 700027

4: The Defence Estate Officer (DEO)  
Itanagar Circle  
Dist. Papum Pare  
Arunachal Pradesh. PIN 791110  
VERSUS

1:Dorjee Khandu Chukla and 6 Ors.

S/o Shri Pasang Tsering Chukla

R/o Vill. Chukla  
Dorjeeling

PO and PS Mechuka  
Dist. Shi Yomi  
Arunachal Pradesh.  
PIN 791003

2:Norbu Tsering Naksang  
S/o Lt. Taling Naksang

R/o Vill. Barangang  
PO and PS Mechuka  
Dist. Shi Yomi  
Arunachal Pradesh. PIN 791003

3:Nyima Chanden Sharjo  
S/o Lt. Sange Dorjee Sharjo

R/o Vill. Mechuka  
PO and PS Mechuka  
Dist. Shi Yomi  
Arunachal Pradesh. PIN 791003

4:Dorjee Dindup Philley  
S/o Sanga Khandu Philley

Vill Segong  
PO and PS Mechuka  
Dist. Shi Yomi  
Arunachal Pradesh. PIN 791003

5:Domdi Sona  
S/o Lt. Nim Chanden Sona

Vill Yorni  
PO and PS Mechuka  
Dist. Shi Yomi  
Arunachal Pradesh.  
PIN 791003

6:Kumar Sona  
S/o Lt. Sange Sona

Vill Yorni  
PO and PS Mechuka

Dist. Shi Yomi  
Arunachal Pradesh. PIN 791003

7: The Collector cum Deputy Commissioner  
Shi Yomi District  
Tato  
Arunachal Pradesh. PIN 791001

Advocate for the Petitioner : 1 Y Doloi  
Advocate for the Respondent : GA (AP)

Linked Case : IA(C) 239/2022

1: The Union of India and 3 Ors.  
Ministry of Defence  
Represented by the Defence Secretary  
101A South Block  
New Delhi 110011

2: The Director General of  
of Defence Estates (DGDE)  
Raksha Sampada Bhawan  
Ulaan Baatar Marg  
Delhi Cantonment. PIN 110010

3: The Principal Director  
of Defence Estates. Eastern Command (PDDEEC)  
AC 4  
4/1  
Belveder Road  
Alipore  
Kolkata  
West Bengal. PIN 700027

4: The Defence Estate Officer (DEO)  
Itanagar Circle  
Dist. Papum Pare  
Arunachal Pradesh. PIN 791110  
VERSUS

1: Libo Ragmuk and 4 Ors.  
S/o Libo Ragmuk  
R/o Vill. Talo  
PO and PS Tato  
Dist. Shi Yomi  
Arunachal Pradesh. PIN 791001

2:Eling Ragmuk  
S/o Late Tabin Ragmuk  
R/o Vill Talo  
PO and PS Tato  
Dist. Shi Yomi  
Arunachal Pradesh. PIN 791001

3:Raju Diru  
S/o Tachuk Diru  
R/o Vill Talo  
PO and PS Tato  
Dist. Shi Yomi  
Arunachal Pradesh. PIN 791001

4:Tajen Diru  
S/o Libu Diru  
R/o Vill Talo  
PO and PS Tato  
Dist. Shi Yomi  
Arunachal Pradesh. PIN 791001

5:The Collector cum Deputy Commissioner  
Shi Yomi District  
Tato  
Arunachal Pradesh. PIN 791001

Advocate for the Petitioner : 1 Y Doloj  
Advocate for the Respondent : GA (AP)

**BEFORE**  
**HONBLE MR. JUSTICE KARDAK ETE**

**ORDER**

**Date : 05-06-2023**

Heard Mr. V. Banerjee, learned ASG for the petitioners assisted by Mr. Y. Doloj, learned Senior Panel Counsel for The Union of India; Mr. Prasant Rawat, learned Advocate; Mr. Tathagat Sharma, learned Advocate and Mr. B. Pathak, learned counsel for the respondents.

Hearing remains inconclusive.

List the matter on 06.06.2023 for further hearing.

**JUDGE**

**Comparing Assistant**